OFFICE OF THE ACCOUNTANT GENERAL (A&E), KERALA, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM

Proceedings of the Screening Committee for Compassionate Appointment

The Committee consisting of Shri D Anish, Senior Deputy Accountant General (Admin & AMG I), Office of the Accountant General (Audit-II), Kerala, Thiruvananthapuram, Smt. Sabitha Balakrishnan, Senior Deputy Accountant General (Pension&GE), Office of the Accountant General (A&E), Kerala, Thiruvananthapuram and Shri P K Lalu, Senior Deputy Accountant General (AMG-II), Office of the Principal Accountant General (Audit-I), Kerala, met on 09th September, 2024 to consider the cases for compassionate appointment in the Office of the Accountant General (A&E), Kerala.

- 1. The Committee was informed that as per the Scheme for Compassionate Appointment, the object of the Scheme is to grant appointment on compassionate grounds to a dependent family member of a Government servant dying in harness or who has retired on medical grounds thereby leaving the family in penury and without any means of livelihood, to relieve the family of the Government servant concerned from financial destitution and to help the family to get over the emergency. The dependent family member for this purpose mean the spouse/son/daughter of the Government servant or the brother or sister in the case of unmarried Government servant who was totally dependent on the Government servant at the time of his death in harness or retirement on medical grounds as the case may be.
- 2. The Committee was informed that in the Headquarters Circular No.02/NGE/2006 circulated vide letter No.09/NGE(Disc.)/29-2005/Vol.V dated 09.01.2006 read with Headquarters Circular letter No.162-NGE (Disc.) /29-2008/Vol.III dated 09.03.2009, a monetary criteria had been fixed for compassionate appointment to various cadres based on the total income of the family from all sources including terminal benefits, excluding GPF; Group 'B':Rs.14 lakh, Group 'C': Rs.9 lakh & Group 'D': Rs.6 lakh. However, as per the instructions contained in Headquarters circular letter dated 09.03.2009 referred to above, the local Head of Department may consider all the cases in terms of parameters prescribed by Government without being restricted by application of monetary limits of terminal benefits etc. received by the family of the Government employee dying in harness or retiring on medical ground and the Heads

Amy

Darkithan

M

of Department would, henceforth, determine eligibility based on monetary criteria (as distinct from a ceiling) amongst other parameters. The monetary criteria would primarily serve as a tool for prioritizing applicants. Its satisfaction would be an important but not a necessary condition for accepting applications for appointments on compassionate ground. All cases where applications are accepted, even if monetary parameters are exceeded, should be justified through a reasoned speaking order, which should meet the test of consistency. The Committee was also informed that no change has been made to the said monetary criteria pursuant to the Central pay Revision 2016.

- 3. The Committee was informed that as per Headquarters Circular No.34 issued in No.09-Staff Entt. (Rules)/C.A/12-2015 dated 28.09.2016 read with Circular No.14 issued in No.52-Staff Entt.(Rules)/A.R/02-2021 dated 20.04.2022, a revised model evaluation system based on a number of parameters prescribed in the scheme with suitable weights assigned to each for consideration of the applicants in a fair and objective manner has been forwarded for guidance with the instruction that the same may be used by the Departmental Screening Committee to judge the applicants being considered under the scheme for compassionate appointment. It is stated in the said Circular dated 28.09.2016 that awarding marks by conducting interview is not required for appointment on compassionate grounds. In place of interview, personal interaction with the candidate would be conducted; however, no marks in this regard will be awarded. It is further stated in the said Circular that the marks obtained in the evaluation system cannot be the only criteria for recommending a case for appointment on compassionate grounds. The marks in the evaluation system only help the DSC to prima facie judge the applicants being considered under the scheme for compassionate appointment. Ultimately, recommendation or rejection of a case by the DSC should be through a speaking order only. Accordingly, the screening committee should give specific and reasoned recommendations in each case considered by it.
- 4. The Committee was informed that as per Department of Personnel and Training OM F No.43019/9/2019-Estt(D) dated 23.08.2021 read with OM F.No.14014/1/2022-Estt.(D) dated 02nd August,2022, prior to every meeting of the Committee, the Applicants whose applications are being considered, should be informed through

My

Datithan

Just/

email or other forms of communication, the number of vacancies in each grade they are being considered and also the date on which the Committee is due to meet to consider their Application. However, the applicant(s) would not be required to have any personal interaction, either with the Administration or the Committee and that the Applicants may not be asked to be present during the meeting of the Committee. The Committee was also informed that the information as per DoPT OM dated 23.08.2021 has been communicated to the applicant in time.

- 5. Headquarters Office has, vide letter No. 06-staff (App)-II/12-2014/Vol,II dated 23.02.2015, instructed that the Screening Committee has to scrupulously follow the instructions on compassionate appointment issued by the DOPT while considering the cases. Accordingly, while considering the cases before it, the Committee has kept in view the consolidated instructions contained in the Department of Personnel and Training O.M.No.14014/02/2012-Estt (D) dated 16.01.2013 and OM No.43019/2019-Estt (D) dated 23.08.2021 read with OM F.No.14014/1/2022-Estt.(D) dated 02nd August, 2022 and the orders/instructions issued by the DOPT as well as by the Headquarters office from time to time.
- 6. The Committee was informed that as per para 7(b) of DoPT OM F.No.14014/1/2022-Estt.(D) dated 02nd August, 2022, compassionate appointment can be made upto a maximum of 5% of vacancies falling under direct recruitment quota in any Group 'C' post. Further, as per para 7(d) of the said OM, the ceiling of direct recruitment vacancies for making compassionate appointment should not be exceeded by utilizing any other vacancy e.g.sports quota vacancy. Applying the said criterion, a total of 09 (Nine) vacancies (03 in Accountant cadre + 01 in Clerk cadre + 05 in MTS cadre = 09) have been earmarked for compassionate appointment during the panel year 2024, out of which one vacancy (Accountant cadre) has been utilized during the panel year 2024. The Committee was also informed that there is only one application of Ms Arundhathi Ramesh D/o Late Ramesh K, a deceased employee of this office for consideration by the 2nd DSC (Departmental Screening Committee) for the year 2024 for appointment on compassionate basis in this office.
- The Committee perused the application, verification report of the Senior Accounts
 Officer (Welfare) as well as other relevant records in respect of the applicant and

My

Destribber

/ hal

evaluation sheet of the applicant based on Headquarters office Circular No.34 issued in No.09-Staff Entt. (Rules)/C.A/12-2015 dated 28.09.2016 read with Circular No.14 issued in No.52-Staff Entt.(Rules)/A.R/02-2021 dated 20.04.2022.

- 8. The Committee considered the application dated 21.05.2024 of Ms. Arundhathi Ramesh, unmarried daughter of Late Ramesh K, Assistant Accounts Officer Branch Office, Kozhikode who expired while in service on 08.12.2023 due to pneumonia. The Committee, on its perusal of the report dated 24.07.2024 submitted by the Sr. Accounts Officer (Welfare) and other records submitted before it by Administration, noted the following:
 - i. Shri Ramesh K, Assistant Accounts Officer commenced his service on 22.06.1987. At the time of his death, he had a total qualifying service of 36 years-04 months-29 days and had a remaining service of 297 days until superannuation. The deceased Government servant belonged to Group 'B' Gazetted category.
 - ii. Late Ramesh K, Assistant Accounts Officer is survived by his wife, Smt Sajitha K (54 years) who was completely dependent on the deceased official and did not have an independent source of income, unmarried daughter Ms. Arundhathi Ramesh (27 years) (the applicant) and elder married daughter Smt Aarathi Ramesh (32 years). Elder daughter, Smt Aarathi Ramesh is staying with her husband in Germany. Smt Sajitha K, W/o Ramesh K and Smt Aarathi Ramesh, elder daughter of Late Ramesh K have given written consent to give compassionate appointment to the applicant, Ms. Arundhathi Ramesh.
 - iii. The applicant Ms. Arundhathi Ramesh, has passed Bachelor of Science in Mathematics with complementary courses in Statistics and Physics in April 2017 from University of Calicut, she has also completed Master of Arts in English from Mangalore University in April 2019. She is presently working as an Assistant Professor in English at the Don Bosco Arts and Science College, Kannur. As per his letter, dated 04.07.2024, the Principal of the said institution has stated that Ms.Arundhathi Ramesh had joined the institution on

My

datoit les

05.09.2023, the appointment being purely temporary. It was also stated that her current monthly salary was Rs. 25,000/-.

iv. The applicant Ms. Arundhathi Ramesh is now residing with her mother at their residence which is a double storied concrete roofed house with a plinth area of 162 m² (approximately 1743 ft²) in Karuvisseri ward, Vengeri Village, Kozhikode with a land area of 7 cents. According to the valuation certificate issued by the Executive Engineer, PWD Building Division, Kozhikode, the residential building in which they reside is valued at ₹19,07,434/-.

Value of assets of the family & terminal benefits received

v. As per the immovable property return submitted on 31.01.2023, four immovable properties have been declared by Late Ramesh K. The details thereof are tabulated below.

	Procise	Nature	Area	Value of	Extent	Mode of
Sl	Precise location of the	of	Airea	property	of	acquisition
No	property	property			interest	
1	Survey	Housing	07	14 Lakh	Full	Purchase
•	No.35/34,		Cents			
	Kozhikode					
	Taluk, Vengeri					
	Village					7.1. '4-4
2	Survey No.94/2	Car Shed	15.5	60 Lakh	Full	Inherited
	Malappuram		Cents			
	District,					
	Perinthalmanna					
	Taluk, Melattur					
	Village.				Destial	Inherited
3	Survey No.94/2	Housing	27.5	01 Crore	Partial	Innerned
	Malappuram		Cents			
	District,					
	Perinthalmanna					
	Taluk, Melattur					
	Village.		2.	45 Loleb	Partial	Inherited.
4	Survey	Pump	01	45 Lakh	Faitiai	Inneritear
	No.314/1	House	Acre			
	Malappuram		and 53			
	District,		Cents			
	Perinthalmanna		Cents			
	Taluk, Melattur					
	Village.	<u></u>				

My

(Dabither

July

- vi. As per the report of Sr Accounts Officer (Welfare) the declared value (Rs 14,00,000/-) of the immovable property against Sl No 1 above covers only the value of the land. According to the valuation certificate issued by the Executive Engineer, PWD Building Division, Kozhikode, the residential building in which they reside is valued at ₹19,07,434/-. Thus the total value of the land and building together comes to ₹33,07,434/-.
- vii. As per the immovable property return detailed above, Late Ramesh K had only partial interest in r/o of properties at Sl No.3 & 4. Further as per the letter dated 14.08.2024 containing the declaration of assets and liabilities by the applicant, the monetary value of the items at Sl No.3 &4 to the extent it relates to Late Ramesh K has been declared as 50% of the value of the said items as disclosed in the immovable property return. As such the net worth of immovable properties relevant to the family of the deceased is arrived at as follows.

			1 .	T =	77.1 C:
Sl	Precise	Nature	Area	Extent	Value of immovable
No	location of the	of		of	property attributable
	property	property		interest	to deceased officer's
					family
1	Survey	Housing	07	Full	33,07,434/-
	No.35/34,		Cents		
	Kozhikode				
	Taluk, Vengeri			74	
	Village				
2	Survey No.94/2	Car Shed	15.5	Full	60,00,000/-
	Malappuram		Cents		
	District,				
	Perinthalmanna				n n
	Taluk, Melattur				and discount of
	Village.		27.5	D .: 1	50.00.000/
3	Survey No.94/2	Housing	27.5	Partial	50,00,000/-
	Malappuram		Cents		
	District,				
	Perinthalmanna				
	Taluk, Melattur				
-	Village.	Dump	01	Partial	22,50,000/-
4	Survey No.314/1	Pump	O1	Taltial	22,30,000/-
	10.314/1				

hof

Jakither

Jan /

Malappuram District, Perinthalmanna Taluk, Melattur	House	Acre and 53 Cents	
Village.			
otal Value of immov	able prope	erties	1,65,57,434

- In her letter dated 14.08.2024, the applicant has stated that the immovable viii. properties at Sl Nos 2,3&4 are inherited and are currently under dispute. The nature of dispute has not been disclosed.
 - Smt Sajitha K, W/o late Ramesh K, is getting enhanced family pension at the ix. rate of Rs.47,750/-p.m plus admissible DR with effect from 09.12.2023 to 08.12.2033. The eligible rate of normal family pension is 28,650/-p.m plus admissible DR with effect from 09.12.2033. She has also been sanctioned (Death Gratuity Rs.20,00,000/-+ CGEGIS 1,35,710/- + Rs.34,13,818/-Terminal Leave Surrender Rs.12,78,108/-) as terminal service benefits.
 - The family has received Rs.10,000/- from IA&AD Benevolent fund. X.
 - The family has received insurance amount Rs.2,00,000/-from the LIC policy. xi. Liabilities of the family
- It has been certified that the Late Ramesh K, has no liability with the AG's xii. Office Employees Co-operative Credit Society LTD No.T.291- Branch Kozhikode and with the Central Govt. Gazetted Officers Co-operative Society Ltd. No.T 394, Thiruvananthapuram.
- An amount of Rs.17,708/- plus interest is outstanding as on 19.04.2024 in the xiii. Housing Loan of Rs.5,50,000/- availed by Late Ramesh K from LIC HFL.
- In her letter dated 14.08.2024, the applicant has stated that in addition to the xiv. outstanding balance of housing loan from LIC HFL, there are liabilities on account of gold loan (3,00,000) and personal loan (8,00,000) to be repaid to relatives. However, no documentary proof in support of the said two stated liabilities has been produced.

doctother has

- 9. The Committee carefully considered the application of Ms. Arundhathi Ramesh based on the documents placed before it. The statement showing the marks awarded as per the revised evaluation system for shortlisting applications for appointment on compassionate ground is appended as Annexure I. After detailed deliberations and careful consideration of all the facts, the Committee found that the case of Ms. Arundhathi Ramesh, unmarried daughter of late Ramesh K, Assistant Accounts Officer who expired while in service on 08.12.2023 is not a deserving case for appointment under the Scheme for Compassionate Appointment on the following grounds:
 - i. The family of the deceased is residing in own house which is double storied with a plinth area of 162 m² situated in 07 cents of land of their own. The family of the applicant also owns 3 other immovable properties. The collective value of immovable properties comes to ₹ 1,65,57,434. As such, the family of Late Ramesh K is in possession of assets of substantial value.
 - ii. Smt Sajitha K, W/o late Ramesh K, is getting enhanced family pension at the rate of Rs.47,750/-p.m plus admissible DR with effect from 09.12.2023, which will be available upto to 08.12.2033. The eligible rate of normal family pension is 28,650/-p.m plus admissible DR with effect from 09.12.2033. She has also been sanctioned Rs.34,13,818/- (Death Gratuity Rs.20,00,000/-+ CGEGIS 1,35,710/- + Terminal Leave Surrender Rs.12,78,108/-) as terminal service benefits against which the only liability is Rs.17,708/- (LIC HFL housing loan).
 - iii. The assessment of need-cum-economic status of the family of the deceased employee under different parameters in Annexure-I evaluation system prescribed by Headquarters Office as per Circular No.34 issued in No.09-Staff Entt. (Rules)/C.A/12-2015 dated 28.09.2016 read with Circular No.14 issued in No.52-Staff Entt.(Rules)/A.R/02-2021 dated 20.04.2022 does not warrant immediate assistance by way of compassionate appointment.
 - iv. As stated in the Scheme for Compassionate Appointment, the object of the Scheme is to grant appointment on compassionate grounds to a dependent family member of a Government servant dying in harness or who has retired on medical grounds thereby leaving the family in penury and without any means of livelihood, to relieve the family of the Government servant

Doo hither

concerned from financial destitution and to help the family to get over the emergency. In the instant case, it is evident from the asset/financial position of the family as disclosed by the report of the Senior Accounts Officer (Welfare) as well from other records that the family of the deceased is neither in penury/financial destitution nor without any means of livelihood. The applicant is also well educated and presently employed in a private college in a temporary post of Assistant Professor and the job is proportionate to her academic qualifications.

- 10. The Committee, therefore, found Ms. Arundhathi Ramesh, D/o Late Ramesh K, Assistant Accounts officer, Branch Office Kozhikode not fit for appointment under the Scheme for Compassionate Appointment.
- 11. The Committee hereby certifies that candidate considered by the Departmental Screening Committee constituted for the purpose of considering the application for appointment under compassionate ground in the Office of the Accountant General (A&E), Kerala is not related to any of the members of the Committe and that otherwise also they are not interested in the candidate.

(P K Lalu)

Senior Deputy Accountant General (AMG-II)
Office of the Accountant General (Audit-I)

Kerala, Thiruvananthapuram

Day pos.

(Sabitha Balakrishnan)

Senior Deputy Accountant General (Pension& GE)
Office of the Accountant General (A&E), Kerala,

Thiruvananthapuram

(D Anish)

Senior Deputy Accountant General (Admin & AMG I)

Office of the Accountant General (Audit-II)

Kerala, Thiruvananthapuram

Annexure I

Revised Evaluation System for shortlisting application for appointment on compassionate ground

(Where the government servant died/retired on medical grounds on or after 01.01.2016)

Ms. Arundhathi Ramesh, Daughter of late Ramesh K,AAO

Total Marks 165

S1	Particulars	Maximum	Range	Marks to be	Marks
No		Marks		provided	awarded
i.	Family pension	25	Upto Rs.9,000/-	25	05
	Rs. 28,650/- PM		Rs.9,001/- to Rs.12,000/-	20	
	(Normal basic FP)		Rs.12,001/- to Rs.16,000/-	15	
			Rs.16,001/- to Rs.20,000/-	10	
	1		Rs.20,001/- and above	05	
ii.	Terminal Benefits	25	Upto Rs.9,00,000/-	25	05
	(DCRG+LE+CGE		Rs.9,00,001/- to	20	F)
	GIS+DLIS)		Rs.12,00,000/-		
	2000000	-	Rs.12,00,001/- to	15	
	+12,78,108+1,35,7		Rs.15,00,000/-		
	10 = 34,13,818/-		Rs.15,00,001/- to	10	28 9
			Rs.18,00,000/-		· .
	ē-		Rs.18,00,001/- and above	05	
iii.	Dependent children	25	Minor child per member	10	10
	of the deceased		Each major son	05	
	employee at the		Each major daughter	10	
	time of his/her			27 0	
	death	6		6.05	
			Subject to maximum of	25	
iv.	Other dependent	25	Parents of deceased	05 marks	00
	family members of		Govt.servant	each	
	the deceased		Brother of deceased	05	
	employee at the		Govt.servant	<u> </u>	
	time of his/her	20	Sister of deceased Govt.	10	
	death	e ,	servant		
\neg			Subject to a maximum of	25	

Y

v.	Immovable	30	Nil	30	05	
	property		Upto Rs 10,00,000	25		
	Rs 1,65,57,434/-		Upto Rs 10,00,001 to Rs	20		
			20,00,000	1 j. ka 7 l		
		0	Upto Rs 20,00,001 to Rs	15		
	5		30,00,000			
			Upto Rs 30,00,001 to Rs	10		
			40,00,001	05		
			Rs 40,00,001 and above		00	
vi.	Job 15		No job in family	15		
			Job in family	00		
vii.	Service left	20	Less than 02 years	05	05	
			02 years to less than 05 years	10		
			05 years to less than 10 years	15		
			10 years and above	20		
	Total marks	165			30	
In addition to the points allotted under REVISED EVALUATION SYSTEM,15						
Bonu	is marks will be allott	ed to the ap	oplicant if she is widow of the deceas	11.1	N III	
empl	oyee and 15 Bonus m	arks will b	e allotted if he/she is an orphaned ch	1110.		

Senior Accounts Officer (C)/C.Cell