

Overview

Performance audit of four major Public Hospitals in Delhi

A performance audit of the functioning of four major public hospitals in Delhi was conducted to assess their functioning in terms of providing proper medical care by efficient use of available resources and infrastructure. The hospitals reviewed were Lok Nayak Hospital (LNH) and Deen Dayal Upadhyay Hospital (DDUH) under the Government of Delhi, Hindu Rao Hospital (HRH) under the MCD and Charak Palika Hospital (CPH) under the NDMC.

Performance audit revealed that the strength of medical, para medical and nursing staff in the four hospitals was less than adequate which adversely affected patient care. The waiting time of patients, who had been advised surgeries and various investigations, increased substantially. The problem was further compounded by significant increase in the patient load while the number of beds in the hospitals remained static leading to overcrowding in the wards. The casualty and emergency services in the hospitals were equally affected by shortage of medical staff, essential drugs and infrastructure facilities.

Purchase of equipment and medicines lacked financial probity. In DDUH, 73 purchase orders were awarded to tenderers other than the lowest and this led to an extra expenditure of Rs.31.67 lakh. Further, purchase of 76 equipment valuing Rs.8.20 crore were also delayed by four to 48 months in LNH, DDUH and HRH due to lack of monitoring and administrative controls. LNH and HRH also accepted medicines and vaccines valuing Rs.1.04 crore from the suppliers with reduced shelf life in violation of the laid down norms.

Hospital ambulances were not utilized for bona fide purpose of shifting the patients alone. The ambulances in two hospitals were also not equipped with essential life support equipment. The stock management policy in the hospitals for stocking of essential life saving drugs and medicines was deficient. Patients suffering from serious diseases including the terminally ill patients remained deprived of the essential life saving drugs and medicines.

The augmentation of the existing facilities in the two major Government hospitals (LNH and DDUH) was afflicted by delays and cost overruns. The management and handling of the bio-medical waste by the hospitals was not efficient and the hospitals were also found to be violating the Bio-Medical Waste Management and Handling Rules, 1998.

The prevention and control of hospital-associated infections was weak and the patient grievance redressal system in the hospitals lacked direction and perspective.

Performance audit of Educational Development of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes

Various educational schemes are implemented by the Union and State governments to enable SC/ST students to upgrade their educational levels and skills and generate self confidence and self reliance. The performance audit examined the implementation of three centrally sponsored and six state schemes by Government of NCT of Delhi during the period from 2001-02 to 2005-06.

Performance audit revealed that planning for implementation of the schemes was not based on definitive data or survey of the targeted population. The department projected the requirements of the schemes on the basis of past trends of expenditure. The systems adopted by the department to publicize and popularize the schemes were inadequate, thus, leaving the possibility of a large number of beneficiaries being excluded from the purview of the centrally and the state sponsored schemes.

The coaching centres being run under “Coaching and Allied Scheme” did not have basic infrastructure facilities, the number of courses held were less and attendance of the students was poor leading to low success rate of the students in various competitive examinations.

The expenditure incurred under the “Post Matric Scholarship Scheme” registered a decline from Rs.1.03 crore in 2001-02 to Rs.19.53 lakh in 2005-06. The Government of NCT of Delhi could not spend their committed liability of Rs 1.03 crore persistently over the years, as a result, central funding was affected. The number of scholarship holders also declined sharply from 2004-05 onwards after transfer of the scheme from Department of Education to the Department for the Welfare of SC/ST/OBC/Minorities.

The Government of NCT of Delhi did not contribute its share of funding under “Book Bank Scheme” meant for assisting the students pursuing professional and post graduate courses. No funds were released by the department to eight polytechnics and two medical colleges during 2001-02 and 2002-03.

The six state schemes reviewed in performance audit lacked direction and purpose. The schemes suffered from delays in release of funds and in disbursement of scholarships. There were also instances of non-reimbursement of tuition fee to the targeted beneficiaries. The students were often deprived of the financial assistance due to inadequate publicity of the schemes. Some of the schemes also lacked transparency as applications of the prospective beneficiaries were rejected by the department without assigning any reasons. Some of the schools did not submit utilization certificates for the grants received from the department. The department ran two overlapping schemes for reimbursement of tuition fee, one under Central Scheme and the other under State Scheme.

Monitoring and evaluation of the schemes by the implementing departments were weak.

Performance audit of Implementation of Mid Day Meal Scheme in Delhi

A mid day meal scheme is being implemented in Delhi by the Government of NCT of Delhi, Municipal Corporation of Delhi (MCD) and the New Delhi Municipal Council (NDMC) for all the children of primary stage (class I to V) in Government, local bodies and Government-aided schools. The Government of NCT of Delhi acts as the nodal department and is responsible for overall planning and ensures the availability of requisite financial, logistical and administrative requirements for the scheme. The Central Government extends support to the scheme by way of free supply of foodgrains and subsidy for transportation of the foodgrains.

A performance audit of the mid day meal scheme in Delhi covering the period from 2001-02 to 2005-06 revealed inadequacies in planning, funds management, implementation and monitoring of the scheme.

Though the scheme has been implemented in Government, MCD and NDMC schools, an estimated 74,000 number of children enrolled in Education Guarantee Scheme/Alternative and Innovative Education Centres in Delhi were left out from the ambit of the scheme, which was contrary to the provisions of the scheme.

There was shortfall of 50 *per cent* in lifting of foodgrains during the period 2001-06 indicating poor implementation of the scheme. No joint inspections were carried out by the implementing agencies to ensure that the foodgrains supplied by the Food Corporation of India were at least of Fair Average Quality.

The financial resources were not optimally utilized. There were substantial savings ranging from 15 to 99 *per cent* in Directorate of Education and NDMC and plan funds of Rs. 2.90 crore were diverted by the MCD for meeting establishment and administrative expenses.

The nodal department did not ensure that the cooked meals being supplied to the schools conformed to the stipulated quality or quantity. In 51 out of 308 schools test checked, cooked meals were short supplied to the extent of 52 grams per child per day. Further, the suppliers of the cooked meals did not have the requisite license from the Health Department and the meals were not being brought by them in sealed containers and, therefore, there always remained the possibility of contamination, adulteration or pilferage during transportation of the meals. Despite the provision that cooked meals should be supplied to the children for a minimum of 200 days in a year, NDMC and Government provided cooked meals for only 112 to 150 days during 2003-04 to 2005-06.

The impact of the scheme on the levels of enrolment, attendance and retention was minimal. Monitoring of the scheme was non-existent till 2005-06. The first meeting of the state level monitoring-cum-steering committee was held only in July 2006.

The Public Accounts Committee had recommended in September 2001 certain steps to improve monitoring and implementation of the scheme. However many of these recommendations were yet to be fully acted upon.