

Chapter- IX

Sustainable Development Goal 3

This Chapter captures the significance of the Sustainable Development Goal 3 which deals with the health and wellbeing conditions of people coupled with value of some key indicators in respect of Uttar Pradesh as compared with all India average.

Audit objective: *Whether the spending on health has improved the health and wellbeing conditions of people as per SDG 3?*

Brief snapshot of the Chapter

- Government of Uttar Pradesh has developed (July 2019) ‘Sustainable Development Goals-Vision 2030’ which *inter alia* envisages to achieve healthy lives and well-being for all at all ages by building a resilient health system. Department of Medical Health & Family Welfare was declared (June 2020) as the nodal department for SDG 3 by the Planning Department of Uttar Pradesh at the State level.
- As against budget provisions of ₹ 18,253.22 crore for programmes related to SDG 3, ₹ 13,094.06 crore (71.74 per cent) was sanctioned by the State Government. However, even the sanctioned funds could not be utilised fully as the expenditure incurred during 2017-21 on SDG 3 was ₹ 9,650.88 crore (73.70 per cent).
- At national level, against 40 indicators for SDG 3, values for 38 indicators were available as per SDG Progress Report 2022-Uttar Pradesh. However, values of only 27 indicators were available at the State level.
- SDG 3 has set a target to reduce the Maternal Mortality Rate (MMR) from the current level to below 70 per lakh live births by 2030. State Government had set a target to achieve MMR to 140 per lakh live births by 2020 as per Vision 2030. However, as per SRS 2018-20 (published in November 2022), MMR was 167 per lakh live births in Uttar Pradesh against the national average of 97 per lakh live births.
- Institutional deliveries in Uttar Pradesh have improved from 67.8 per cent (NFHS¹-4: 2015-16) to 83.4 per cent (NFHS-5: 2019-21). Further, under the indicators (Neo-natal Mortality Rate, Infant Mortality Rate and Under 5 Mortality Rate) of child health, there was improvement from NFHS 4 (2015-16) to NFHS 5 (2019-21). Sex ratio at birth in Uttar Pradesh has improved from 903 (NFHS 4: 2015-16) to 941 (NFHS 5: 2019-21).

9.1 Introduction

The United Nations General Assembly adopted the resolution ‘Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development’ on 25 September 2015. India is committed to 2030 Agenda and SDGs were to be taken key contours of envisioning development up to local level. The Government of Uttar

¹ National Family Health Survey.

Pradesh has framed (July 2019) ‘Sustainable Development Goals-Vision 2030’ for the implementation of SDG in the State.

Sustainable Development Goal 3 (SDG 3) seeks to ensure health and well-being for all, at every stage of life. Vision-2030 of Uttar Pradesh *inter alia* envisages to achieve healthy lives and well-being for all at all ages by building a resilient health system through people centred, evidence-based, equity-driven, inter-departmental and inter-sectoral collaborative approaches to guarantee preventive, promotive, diagnostic, curative, rehabilitative and palliative care across all levels of service provision and through the life course.

Department of Medical Health & Family Welfare was declared (June 2020) as the nodal department for implementation of SDG 3 by the Planning department of Uttar Pradesh at the State level. At the district level, CMO was declared as nodal officer for implementation and monitoring of SDG 3.

9.2 Resource mobilisation

9.2.1 Mobilisation of financial resources

To meet the physical targets and achieve higher place among States, budget allocations were to be linked with the SDG 3 goal. Accordingly, the State Government made budget provisions to cater to the need of achieving various targets under different schemes. The budget provisions *vis-à-vis* expenditure under various schemes of SDG 3 in Uttar Pradesh for the period 2017-21² are given in **Table 9.1**.

Table 9.1: Budget provisions *vis-à-vis* expenditure for SDG 3 (2017-21)

(₹ in crore)				
Year	Budget provisions	Funds sanctioned	Expenditure	Percentage of expenditure (4/3*100)
1	2	3	4	5
2017-18	3265.53	3011.95	2312.15	76.77
2018-19	4953.45	4145.00	2893.79	69.81
2019-20	5243.22	2944.03	2367.81	80.43
2020-21	4791.02	2993.08	2077.13	69.40
Total	18253.22	13094.06	9650.88	73.70

(Source: DGMH)

It may be seen from above that during 2017-21, against the budget provisions of ₹ 18,253.22 crore for programmes related to SDG 3, ₹ 13,094.06 crore (71.74 *per cent*) was sanctioned by the State Government. However, even the sanctioned funds could not be utilised fully as the expenditure incurred during 2017-21 on programme related to SDG 3 was ₹ 9,650.88 crore (73.70 *per cent*). Further, except 2019-20, there was a declining trend in the percentage utilisation of funds during the same period. Moreover, the health budget of the State was also not at par with the envisaged allocation of eight *per cent vis-à-vis* total budget of the State by 2020, as the allocation was ranging between 4.20 *per cent*

² DGMH had provided incomplete information with respect to year 2021-22.

and 5.41 *per cent* during 2016-22, as discussed under **Paragraphs 6.3.1** and **6.3.2** of the Report.

The Government's reply was awaited (August 2024) despite reminders.

9.2.2 Mobilisation of human resources

National Health Policy, 2017 focuses on closing of infrastructure and human resource gaps, optimum use of existing manpower and infrastructure as available in the health sector. Vision-2030 of Uttar Pradesh for SDG 3 provides for reviewing the requirement of human resources as per standard norms and population projection-2020 and subsequent revision in number of sanctioned position, if any.

As per data of the State Government³ based on NSSO 2017-18 estimates, the health workers' density per lakh population in Uttar Pradesh *vis-à-vis* all India average were as given in **Tables 9.2 (A), 9.2 (B)** and **9.2 (C)**.

Table 9.2 (A): Doctors and nurses in public and private sectors

(in *per cent*)

State/India	Doctors		Nurses	
	Private	Public	Private	Public
Uttar Pradesh	88.21	11.79	45.37	54.63
India	65.17	34.83	50.81	49.19

(Source: Department of MH&FW, Government of Uttar Pradesh)

Table 9.2 (B): Doctors per lakh population

State/India	Allopathic doctors	AYUSH doctors	All doctors
Uttar Pradesh	63.5	13.2	76.7
India	61.5	18.2	79.7

(Source: Department of MH&FW, Government of Uttar Pradesh)

Table 9.2 (C): Nurses and Midwives density per lakh population

State/India	Nurses and midwives	Pharmacists	Ancillary health workers
Uttar Pradesh	24.1	18.8	13.1
India	61.3	22.5	34.1

(Source: Department of MH&FW, Government of Uttar Pradesh)

As evident from above tables, 88 *per cent* doctors and 45 *per cent* nurses in the State were in private sector. Further, Uttar Pradesh had 63.5 allopathic doctors per lakh population, which was better than all India average of 61.5 doctors per lakh population. However, overall availability of doctors was 76.7 doctors per lakh population which was less than the all India average of 79.7 doctors per lakh population. The availability of nurses and midwives, pharmacists and ancillary health workers per lakh population was less than the all India average.

Further, as discussed in **Chapter II** of this report, there were shortages of doctors and other human resources in government HCFs and delays in recruitment which has affected delivery of services in HCFs.

The Government's reply was awaited (August 2024) despite reminders.

³ Director General Medical and Health Service letter no. 17F/Ni Ni B/Camp/2000/321 dated 7 March 2022 vide which information regarding human resource with respect to SDG 3 was submitted to the State Government.

9.3 Performance indicators

Indicators can be described as a backbone of monitoring the SDGs at various levels like local, national, regional, and global. Indicators serve as a tool to develop implementation strategies and allocate resources accordingly, and as a score card to measure progress towards achieving a target and to ensure the accountability of the Governments and other stakeholders for achieving the SDGs.

SDG Progress Report 2022-Uttar Pradesh (published by Department of Planning, Uttar Pradesh) provides values of 27 indicators at the State level whereas values for 38 indicators were available at national level for SDG 3 as detailed in *Appendix 9.1*.

Further, according to the NITI Aayog⁴, Uttar Pradesh has been lagging behind in the overall performance of SDG 3 and was at 27th place with an index score of 60 among all states against the index score of India (74).

The Government's reply was awaited (August 2024) despite reminders.

Performance with reference to some of the indicators of SDG 3 have been discussed in the succeeding paragraphs:

9.3.1 Maternal mortality rate

SDG 3 has set a target to reduce the Maternal Mortality Rate (MMR) from the current level to below 70 per lakh live births by 2030. In respect of Uttar Pradesh, MMR was 167 per lakh live births against the national average of 97 per lakh live births as per SRS 2018-20⁵, which is behind the neighbouring States like Rajasthan (113) and Bihar (118). Further, in terms of target to achieve MMR to 140 per lakh live births by 2020 as per Vision 2030 of the State Government, it was higher at 167 (SRS 2018-20) but State has improved from MMR of 197 (SRS 2016-18).

The Government's reply was awaited (August 2024) despite reminders.

9.3.2 Institutional delivery

Institutional deliveries are the proportion of births occurring in health facilities in the area. Increasing institutional deliveries is an important factor in reducing maternal and neonatal mortality. Further, Vision 2030 of the State Government had set a target to increase institutional delivery by 90 *per cent*.

Institutional deliveries in Uttar Pradesh have improved from 67.8 *per cent* (NFHS 4: 2015-16) to 83.4 *per cent* (NFHS 5: 2019-21). However, its value was lower than all India average (88.6 *per cent*) as per data of NFHS-5 and SDG

⁴ SDG India, Index & Dashboard 2020-21.

⁵ Special Bulletin on MMR 2018-20, Sample Registration System (SRS), Office of Registrar General of India (published in November 2022).

target (90 per cent) for 2017-20 set in Vision 2030 document of Uttar Pradesh. Further, there were shortfalls in the achievements *vis-à-vis* targets set in the State during 2017-18 to 2021-22 as shown in **Table 9.3**.

Table 9.3: Achievements *vis-à-vis* targets of Institutional deliveries

Year	Target	Achievement	Percentage of achievement
2017-18	3944248	2946773	74.71
2018-19	5426834	3401350	62.68
2019-20	5443165	3605433	66.24
2020-21	5479653	3407794	62.19
2021-22 (upto January 2022)	5581024	2748297	49.24

(Source: Department of MH&FW, Government of Uttar Pradesh)

It may be seen from above that except 2019-20, the achievements against the targets of institutional deliveries in Uttar Pradesh was on consistent decline from 74.71 in 2017-18 to 62.19 per cent in 2020-21. However, the number of institutional deliveries were in increasing number between 2017-18 to 2019-20.

The Government's reply was awaited (August 2024) despite reminders.

9.3.3 Neo-natal Mortality Rate, Infant Mortality Rate and Under 5 Mortality Rate

SDG 3 has set a target to end preventable deaths of newborns and children under five years of age aiming to reduce Neonatal Mortality to at least as low as 12 per 1,000 live births and Under-5 Mortality to at least as low as 25 per 1,000 live births by 2030.

The status of Neonatal Mortality Rate (NMR), Infant Mortality Rate (IMR) and Under 5 Mortality Rate per 1,000 live births in Uttar Pradesh *vis-à-vis* India as per NFHS-5 compared to NFHS-4 has been given in **Table 9.4**.

Table 9.4: Status of NMR, IMR & U5MR in Uttar Pradesh vis a vis India

Indicators	NFHS-4 (2015-16)		NFHS-5 (2019-21)	
	Uttar Pradesh	India	Uttar Pradesh	India
NMR	45.1	29.5	35.7	24.9
IMR	63.5	40.7	50.4	35.2
U5MR	78.1	49.7	59.8	41.9

(Source: NFHS-5; India fact sheet and Uttar Pradesh fact sheet)

It may be seen from above that in Uttar Pradesh, under these indicators (NMR, IMR and U5MR) of child health, there was improvement from NFHS 4 (2015-16) to NFHS 5 (2019-21) due to decline in mortality rate but the State fell behind the targets set under Vision document of Uttar Pradesh, wherein by 2020 U5MR was to be limited to 40 and NMR to 25 respectively. This was indicative of the fact that more efforts were required to achieve the goal by 2030.

The Government's reply was awaited (August 2024) despite reminders.

9.3.4 Sex ratio at birth

Sex ratio is used to describe the number of females per 1000 of males. Sex ratio is a valuable source for finding the population of women in India and what is the ratio of women to that of men in total population. Under SDG 5 activities are suggested to address the issue of skewed child sex ratio.

Sex ratio at birth in Uttar Pradesh has improved from 903 (NFHS 4: 2015-16) to 941 (NFHS 5: 2019-21) which was even better than India which stood at 929⁶. In comparison to neighbouring States, Uttar Pradesh was ahead of Bihar (908) and Rajasthan (891) but was below Madhya Pradesh (956)⁷. The State Government, in order to apprehend the person involved in sex selection and female foeticide, has started ‘*Mukhbir Yojana*’ in July 2017 under which 12 successful decoy operations had been conducted as of January 2022 and cases lodged in courts of law against units violating the Pre-conception and Prenatal Diagnostic Techniques (Prohibition of Sex Selection) Act, 1994.

The Government’s reply was awaited (August 2024) despite reminders.

9.3.5 Immunisation of 9-11 months old children

Under SDG 3, Uttar Pradesh aims to achieve universal coverage with routine immunisation of children by 2024. As such, it has set targets for immunisation of children in the age group of 9 to 11 months as given in **Table 9.5**.

Table 9.5: Achievements vis-à-vis targets of immunisation

Year	Target	Achievement	Percentage of achievement
2017-18	5786127	4714931	81.49
2018-19	5748993	5022753	87.37
2019-20	5799996	5433763	93.69
2020-21	5826695	4984015	85.54
2021-22 (upto December 2021)	4268391	3441289	81.00

(Source: Department of H&FW)

Table 9.5 shows that the rate of immunisation consistently increased from 81.49 *per cent* in 2017-18 to 93.69 *per cent* in 2019-20 with subsequent decline in 2020-21 at 85.54 *per cent*. However, in none of the year, the rate of immunisation could achieve the targets set by the State.

The Government’s reply was awaited (August 2024) despite reminders.

⁶ As per NFHS 5-2019-21.

⁷ Data of these States are as per NFHS-5-2019-21.

To sum up, the sanctioned funds for SDG 3 could not be utilised fully during 2017-21. Further, Uttar Pradesh had measured values of 27 indicators of SDG 3 against 38 indicators at the national level. Further, in comparison to all India average value of SDG 3 indicators, the State was behind in respect of indicators, viz., institutional deliveries, neo-natal mortality rate, infant mortality rate and under 5 mortality rate, though improvements were noticed.

Recommendations:

State Government should:

31. *utilise the budgeted provisions to achieve the SDG goal by 2030;*
32. *measure the value of all indicators in order to monitor the performance of the State in achievement of the SDG;*
33. *ensure adherence to the roadmap framed in 'Uttar Pradesh Sustainable Development Goals-Vision 2030' to achieve the envisaged SDG targets.*



(RAM HIT)

Principal Accountant General (Audit-I)
Uttar Pradesh

PRAYAGRAJ
THE **28 OCT 2024**

COUNTERSIGNED



(GIRISH CHANDRA MURMU)

Comptroller and Auditor General of India

NEW DELHI
THE **29 OCT 2024**