

Chapter 5

Monitoring

Monitoring of implementation of the Scheme was deficient in many respects. DCPUs were to organize quarterly meetings with stakeholders to review the progress of child protection activities but such meetings were either not conducted or conducted with time lag. DCPUs also did not conduct inspections of CCIs as required and where inspections were conducted, there was no follow up to ensure that deficiencies pointed out were addressed. No Progress Reports with regard to implementation of the Scheme were submitted to the Government by DSCPS as required under the ICPS guidelines. In the absence of regular monitoring and inspection effective implementation of ICPS was compromised.

5.1 Progress reports not submitted to Government of India by DSCPS

As per the Chapter 4 of ICPS Guidelines, DSCPS was required to furnish Quarterly Progress Reports to Ministry of Women and Child Development (MoWCD), Government of India (GoI). Supreme Court had also directed (April 2015) that MoWCD should impress upon all States to submit Quarterly Progress Reports through online mechanism.

Audit, however, observed that DSCPS neither prepared nor submitted Progress Reports to MoWCD since September 2017. It shows lack of proper monitoring and supervision in implementation of the ICPS.

In its reply, DWCD stated (December 2021) that quarterly Monitoring Reports were regularly submitted to MoWCD through online portal which is under upgradation and status in this regard is still awaited from GoI. Reply is not acceptable as records made available to audit revealed that no such Progress Report was submitted to MoWCD. No documentary evidence was furnished in support of their reply.

5.2 Deficient monitoring by District Child Protection Units

ICPS prescribes setting up of DCPUs as fundamental units for implementation of ICPS at District level. DCPUs were made responsible for all activities in relation to providing care to children in their respective Districts such as identification of children in need, creation of District specific data base of children in vulnerable condition, effective implementation of child protection legislations, ensuring an individual care plan for each child in need of care, identification of and support to voluntary organisations, etc. In effect, while CWC is the authority to decide upon the course of action in each case of children produced before it, DCPUs make arrangements for care and protection of children at ground level.

Even after their constitution, functioning of DCPUs left much to be desired as audit observed deficiencies in various aspects of implementation of ICPS such as identification of children in need, conducting meetings with stakeholders etc. as discussed in the succeeding paragraphs.

5.2.1 Quarterly meetings with stakeholders not conducted

ICPS Guidelines stipulates that DCPU has to organize quarterly meetings with all stakeholders at district level which includes Superintendents of Homes, NGOs, etc. and representatives from Health, Labour and Police Departments to review the progress and achievement of child protection activities. It is the duty of DCPUs to circulate the minutes of the meetings to the stakeholders concerned.

Out of the four test-checked DCPUs, two¹⁵ DCPUs had not conducted any meeting whereas DCPU-VI, North and DCPU-I, Central had conducted three and one meeting against the prescribed 12 meetings during 2018-21. Moreover, no member from Health, Labour or Police Departments attended these quarterly meetings and minutes of the meeting were not circulated to any of the departments/units etc. DCPU-I stated that due to overburden, the minutes were not circulated.

DWCD stated (December 2021) that notice for meeting at West and South West Districts has been issued in December 2021. Further, DCPU now functions under the supervision of the District Magistrates (DMs) and DMs are expected to review/conduct meeting with the stakeholders. The reply indicates that meetings were not being conducted as required.

Regular interaction with stakeholders was necessary to resolve various difficulties faced by them and ensure that all the services envisaged under the scheme are provided to the children in need. In the absence of regular meetings and proper follow up on decisions taken, DCPU was not in a position to ensure effective implementation of the Scheme.

5.2.2 Inspections of CCIs not conducted

As per ICPS guidelines, DCPU shall coordinate and supervise implementation of the ICPS at District level including monitoring and supervision of all institutions/agencies/ projects/programs/NGOs and shall report to SCPS at the State level.

Test check of Inspection Reports of CCIs by DCPU-II (North-East and Shahdara) revealed common deficiencies such as toilet flush not working, pending repairs of washrooms and toilets, seepage in dormitory etc. Similarly, in CCIs inspected by DCPU-I (Central) also, there were some common deficiencies such as unavailability of counseling rooms, shortage of beds, unavailability of part-time doctors, unavailability of sick rooms, etc. The

¹⁵ DCPU-II (North East and Shahdara) and DCPU-III (Lajpat Nagar)

DCPUs were required to follow up compliance of these shortcomings, but Compliance Report of these Inspection Reports were not found in the records. This clearly shows that DCPUs, even when they visited the CCIs, did not follow up, to check the compliance of issues pointed out during inspections.

No specific reply was furnished by the Department in this regard.

Further, as per para 2.1(xv) of ICPS Guidelines, DCPU should conduct visits of all institutions/agencies for supervision and to ascertain that proper facilities are being provided. The status of Inspections conducted in the four test-checked CCIs by DCPUs is given in **Table 5.1**.

Table 5.1: Number of inspections conducted by DCPU

DCPU	Number of CCIs under jurisdiction of DCPU	Number of inspections conducted		
		2018-19	2019-20	2020-21
North	08	05	00	06
South	20	36	54	36
Central	08	01	01	05
North-East and Shahdara	03	03	00	03

It can be seen from above table that DCPUs North and Central did not cover all CCIs under them even once in a year. DCPUs, North-East and Shahdara did not carry out any inspection in 2019-20. Inspection by DCPU, Central was particularly deficient. It indicates poor monitoring of CCIs by DCPUs.

In its reply, DWCD stated (December 2021) that Inspections of CCIs are conducted on a regular basis and meetings of the Management Committees headed by DCPO are held on a monthly basis for management of institutions and to monitor the progress of every child. The reply is not tenable as the Inspections of CCIs were not being conducted by the selected DCPUs.

5.2.3 Children's identity indicators on all-India web portal not ensured

Ministry of Women and Child Development, GoI had setup the 'TrackChild' Web Portal for tracking missing children and for their ultimate repatriation to rehabilitation. Information about children is to be entered by the ICPS functionaries on this portal for enabling centralised coordination. As mentioned in the order issued in September 2019 by DWCD, DCPU is responsible for monitoring the web portal and has to facilitate the CWC and CCIs in registering /uploading/updating the details of children on the portal from time to time.

It was observed that only 17 out of 44 CCIs under the four test-checked DCPUs were uploading details on the Web Portal as given in **Table 5.2**.

Table 5.2: Number of CCIs which are uploading information of children on web portal

Test-checked DCPU	Number of CCIs	No. of CCIs uploading details on Web- portal
North	8	1 (for remaining CCIs the data is at other district’s portal)
South	20	14
Central	8	0
North-East and Shahdara	8	2
Total	44	17

Moreover none of the four test-checked CWCs uploaded information of children¹⁶ sent to CCI by CWC during the period 2018-19 to 2020-21. Two CWCs did not even have an active password available to access the portal.

Position of admission and uploading the details of children on portal in respect of test-checked Children Homes, Open Shelters and Specialised Agencies is given in **Table 5.3**.

Table 5.3: Status of uploading of details of children on web portal

Sl. No.	Name	Deficiency noticed
Children Homes		
1.	CHB-I, Alipur	Details of 16 out of 616 children uploaded.
2.	CHB-II, Alipur	Details of 41 out of 133 children uploaded.
3.	CHG-I, Nirmal Chhaya	Children’s details not uploaded.
4.	CHG-II, Nirmal Chhaya	Information not provided to Audit
5.	CHG-IV, Nirmal Chhaya	Information not provided to Audit
6.	VCH-I, Lajpat Nagar	Information not provided to Audit
7.	Prayas CHB, Jahangir Puri	Details of 50 out of 455 children uploaded
8.	CHB, DMRC Tis Hazari	Details of 230 out of 523 children uploaded
9.	SBT Aasra CHB Najafgarh	Children’s photos not uploaded on portal
Open Shelters		
10.	Apna Ghar SBT	ID not issued to CCI by DCPU
11.	SPID Shraddhanand Marg	ID not issued to CCI by DCPU
Specialised Adoption Agencies		
12.	SAA Nirmal Chhaya Complex	Information uploaded
13.	Welfare Home for Children, Sarita Vihar	Information uploaded

Even though majority of the CCIs were not uploading information of children staying there or produced before them, no action was taken by the respective DCPU in this regard. DCPUs did not even provide access to the Web Portal to two Open Shelters.

This compromised the ability of the Government to track missing children, their recovery and rehabilitation, thereby prolonging the suffering of affected children and their parents.

¹⁶ 5769 children were sent to CCIs by three CWCs. Information not provided by remaining one CWC

DWCD stated (December 2021) that the National Web Portal “TrackChild” is based on the provisions of earlier Act, of 2000 and therefore DCPUs encountered difficulties in uploading the information. However, on another portal created by National Commission for Protection of Child Rights (NCPCR) namely Bal Swaraj, DCPUs have been uploading the desired details and particulars of children on a regular basis. Reply is not acceptable as DWCD was required to upload the details of children on Web Portal “TrackChild” under the provisions of ICPS guidelines and JJ Model Rules, 2016. Further, DWCD did not furnish supporting documents in respect of uploading the details of children on NCPCR portal.

Recommendation no. 9: For centralized coordination, complete data may be uploaded in Track Child Portal in a time bound manner.

5.3 Review of CWCs not conducted

As Section 27 (8) of JJ Act, 2015, the District Magistrate (DM) shall conduct a Quarterly Review of the functioning of CWC. Audit observed that against the required 48 Quarterly Reviews for four CWCs during 2018 to 2021, only one Quarterly Review was done (CWC-II, Lajpat Nagar). In the absence of quarterly reviews by the District Magistrates (DMs) functioning of CWCs was not being monitored/watched properly as per JJ Act, 2015.

In its reply, DWCD stated (December 2021) that CWCs have been advised to submit self-appraisal reports to the DM concerned.

5.4 Lack of supervision by Superintendents of CCIs

ICPS Guidelines required the Superintendents of CCIs to either reside within the institution or in quarters in the premises to supervise the overall care of the children. Further, Rule 61(2) of JJ Model Rules, 2016 stipulates that the Person-in-charge shall stay within the premises to be readily available as and when required by the children or the staff and in case where an accommodation is not available in the premises, he shall stay at a place in close proximity to the Child Care Institution till such time such accommodation is made available within the premises of the Child Care Institution.

During field visits of the test-checked nine Children Homes and two Open Shelters, Audit found that Superintendents were not residing within the institution or in quarters in the premises except two CCIs¹⁷ which is in violation of the provisions of the Act.

In its reply, DWCD stated (December 2021) that institutions run 24x7 and an officer of supervisory level is mandatorily deployed at all the time to manage the functioning of the CCIs. Reply is not tenable as Superintendents were not residing in the selected CCIs and no supporting documents were produced to audit regarding deployment of Supervisory level officers. Besides, it was found

¹⁷ Prayas Children Home for Boys, Jahangir Puri and SPID, Shraddhanand Marg

that Persons-in-charge of one CCI was also given charge of other CCIs as commented in para 3.2.1 of Chapter 3 of this Report.

In the absence of regular monitoring and inspection of Child Care Institutions by District Child Protection Unit, effective implementation of Integrated Child Protection Scheme was compromised.

Recommendation no. 10: District Child Protection Units should conduct regular monitoring and inspection of Child Care Institutions.