

APPENDICES

Appendix 5.1
(Reference: Paragraph 5.2.1)
Property tax collection efficiency in test-checked ULBs during 2015-16 to 2019-20

| Sr. No. | Name of the ULB | Total demand (₹ in crore) | Total collection (₹ in crore) | Collection efficiency percentage |
|---|------------------|------------------------------|----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Municipal Corporations | | | | |
| 1 | Greater Mumbai | 84777.14 | 24027.3 | 28 |
| 2 | Nagpur | 3055.54 | 1016.86 | 33 |
| 3 | Latur | 306.47 | 106.18 | 35 |
| 4 | Pimpri-Chinchwad | 6119.96 | 2179.96 | 36 |
| 5 | Nashik | 1340.68 | 514.46 | 38 |
| 6 | Vasai-Virar | 635.96 | 391.92 | 62 |
| 7 | Thane | 3097.68 | 2193.30 | 71 |
| 8 | Amravati | 218.28 | 168.26 | 77 |
| Average collection efficiency in Municipal Corporation | | | | 47 |
| Municipal Councils (MC) | | | | |
| 9 | Talegaon-Dabhade | 281.13 | 68.93 | 25 |
| 10 | Sinnar | 42.14 | 11.97 | 28 |
| 11 | Jalna | 73.71 | 25.82 | 35 |
| 12 | Alibaug | 34.25 | 13.31 | 39 |
| 13 | Mahabaleshwar | 32.54 | 13.53 | 42 |
| 14 | Hinganghat | 29.29 | 13.71 | 47 |
| 15 | Trimbak | 15.71 | 7.57 | 48 |
| 16 | Chopada | 22.36 | 11.07 | 50 |
| 17 | Khopoli | 87.23 | 45.64 | 52 |
| 18 | Dhamangaon | 5.78 | 3.07 | 53 |
| 19 | Yavatmal | 72.79 | 44.37 | 61 |
| 20 | Ichalkaranji | 21.75 | 13.70 | 63 |
| 21 | Nandura | 4.47 | 2.84 | 63 |
| 22 | Nandurbar | 67.15 | 42.95 | 64 |
| 23 | Barshi | 41.99 | 27.39 | 65 |
| 24 | Khamgaon | 28.41 | 18.70 | 66 |
| 25 | Osmanabad | 16.02 | 10.82 | 68 |
| 26 | Sillod | 3.18 | 2.48 | 78 |
| 27 | Katol | 0.12 | 0.10 | 81 |
| 28 | Malkapur | 12.22 | 9.89 | 81 |
| 29 | Ramtek | 3.91 | 3.17 | 81 |
| 30 | Kulgaon-Badlapur | 106.07 | 91.16 | 86 |
| 31 | Khultabad | 0.95 | 0.85 | 90 |
| 32 | Nilanga | 1.88 | 1.73 | 92 |
| Nagar Panchayats (NP) | | | | |
| 33 | Motala | 3.83 | 0.57 | 15 |
| 34 | Renapur | 2.27 | 0.39 | 17 |
| 35 | Shirur Anantpal | 1.58 | 0.40 | 25 |
| 36 | Bhatkuli | 1.34 | 0.45 | 34 |
| 37 | Sakri | 4.52 | 1.61 | 36 |
| 38 | Murbad | 17.68 | 6.99 | 40 |
| 39 | Mohadi | 2.24 | 0.90 | 40 |
| 40 | Shirala | 3.48 | 1.58 | 45 |
| 41 | Sindkhed | 9.70 | 5.46 | 56 |
| 42 | Tala | 1.11 | 0.72 | 65 |
| 43 | Medha | 0.66 | 0.43 | 65 |
| 44 | Lakhani | 1.88 | 1.22 | 65 |
| Average collection efficiency in MC and NP | | | | 54 |
| Average collection efficiency of 44 test-checked ULBs | | | | 53 |
| <i>Source: Information obtained from ULBs</i> | | | | |

Appendix 5.2

(Reference: Paragraph 5.6)

Arrears in audit by Director of Local Fund Accounts Audit in test-checked ULBs

| Sr. No. | Name of the ULB | Corporation/Council/ Nagar Panchayat | Year upto which Audited by Director of Local Fund since 2015-16 |
|----------------|------------------------|---|--|
| 1 | Greater Mumbai | Corporation | 2015-16 |
| 2 | Nagpur | Corporation | 2015-16 |
| 3 | Thane | Corporation | Not Done |
| 4 | Vasai-Virar | Corporation | 2017-18 |
| 5 | Pimpri-Chinchwad | Corporation | Not done |
| 6 | Nashik | Corporation | 2015-16 |
| 7 | Amravati | Corporation | Not Done |
| 8 | Latur | Corporation | 2017-18 |
| 9 | Kulgaon-Badlapur | Council | 2018-19 |
| 10 | Khopoli | Council | Not done |
| 11 | Alibaug | Council | 2018-19 |
| 12 | Ichalkaranji | Council | 2018-19 |
| 13 | Barshi | Council | 2019-20 |
| 14 | Talegaon-Dabhade | Council | Not done |
| 15 | Mahabaleshwar | Council | 2017-18 |
| 16 | Malkapur | Council | Not done |
| 17 | Nandurbar | Council | Not done |
| 18 | Sinnar | Council | Not done |
| 19 | Chopada | Council | 2018-19 |
| 20 | Trimbak | Council | Not done |
| 21 | Osmanabad | Council | 2019-20 |
| 22 | Jalna | Council | 2019-20 |
| 23 | Sillod | Council | Not Done |
| 24 | Khultabad | Council | Not done |
| 25 | Nilanga | Council | Not Done |
| 26 | Hinganghat | Council | 2018-19 |
| 27 | Katol | Council | 2018-19 |
| 28 | Ramtek | Council | 2018-19 |
| 29 | Yavatmal | Council | Not Done |
| 30 | Khamgaon | Council | 2019-20 |
| 31 | Nandura | Council | 2019-20 |
| 32 | Dhamangaon | Council | Not Done |
| 33 | Renapur | Nagar Panchayat | Not Done |
| 34 | Mohadi | Nagar Panchayat | 2019-20 |
| 35 | Lakhani | Nagar Panchayat | Not Done |
| 36 | Shirur Anantpal | Nagar Panchayat | Not done |
| 37 | Sindkhed | Nagar Panchayat | 2018-19 |
| 38 | Sakri | Nagar Panchayat | Not done |
| 39 | Shirala | Nagar Panchayat | 2018-19 |
| 40 | Medha | Nagar Panchayat | 2018-19 |
| 41 | Murbad | Nagar Panchayat | Not Done |
| 42 | Tala | Nagar Panchayat | 2018-19 |
| 43 | Bhatkuli | Nagar Panchayat | Not Done |
| 44 | Motala | Nagar Panchayat | Not Done |

Source: Information obtained from ULBs

Appendix 5.3
(Reference: Paragraph 5.6)

Non-preparation of accounts on accrual basis

| Sr. No. | Name of the ULB | Corporation/Council/ Nagar Panchayat | Year upto which accounts are prepared on accrual basis since 2015-16 |
|----------------|------------------------|---|---|
| 1 | Greater Mumbai | Corporation | 2020-21 |
| 2 | Nagpur | Corporation | 2020-21 |
| 3 | Thane | Corporation | 2018-19 |
| 4 | Vasai-Virar | Corporation | 2019-20 |
| 5 | Pimpri-Chinchwad | Corporation | 2019-20 |
| 6 | Nashik | Corporation | 2019-20 |
| 7 | Amravati | Corporation | 2020-21 |
| 8 | Latur | Corporation | Not Done |
| 9 | Kulgaon-Badlapur | Council | 2019-20 |
| 10 | Khopoli | Council | 2019-20 |
| 11 | Alibaug | Council | 2019-20 |
| 12 | Ichalkaranji | Council | 2016-17 |
| 13 | Barshi | Council | 2019-20 |
| 14 | Talegaon-Dabhade | Council | 2019-20 |
| 15 | Mahabaleshwar | Council | 2019-20 |
| 16 | Malkapur | Council | 2017-18 |
| 17 | Nandurbar | Council | 2019-20 |
| 18 | Sinnar | Council | Not Done |
| 19 | Chopada | Council | 2016-17 |
| 20 | Trimbak | Council | 2019-20 |
| 21 | Osmanabad | Council | Not Done |
| 22 | Jalna | Council | 2019-20 |
| 23 | Sillod | Council | Not Done |
| 24 | Khultabad | Council | Not Done |
| 25 | Nilanga | Council | Not Done |
| 26 | Hinganghat | Council | 2016-17 |
| 27 | Katol | Council | 2016-17 |
| 28 | Ramtek | Council | 2018-19 |
| 29 | Yavatmal | Council | 2016-17 |
| 30 | Khamgaon | Council | 2019-20 |
| 31 | Nandura | Council | 2019-20 |
| 32 | Dhamangaon | Council | 2016-17 |
| 33 | Sindkhed | Nagar Panchayat | 2019-20 |
| 34 | Sakri | Nagar Panchayat | Not Done |
| 35 | Shirala | Nagar Panchayat | Not Done |
| 36 | Medha | Nagar Panchayat | Not Done |
| 37 | Mohadi | Nagar Panchayat | Not Done |
| 38 | Lakhani | Nagar Panchayat | 2019-20 |
| 39 | Renapur | Nagar Panchayat | Not Done |
| 40 | Shirur Anantpal | Nagar Panchayat | Not Done |
| 41 | Murbad | Nagar Panchayat | Not Done |
| 42 | Tala | Nagar Panchayat | Not Done |
| 43 | Bhatkuli | Nagar Panchayat | 2019-20 |
| 44 | Motala | Nagar Panchayat | 2019-20 |

Source: Information obtained from ULBs

Appendix 6.1
(Reference: Paragraph 6.1)

Sanctioned strength vis-à-vis population in the test-checked ULBs

| Sr. No. | Name of the ULB | Population as per Census 2011 | Sanctioned strength | Employees sanctioned per 1000 population |
|--|------------------|-------------------------------|---------------------|--|
| Municipal Corporations | | | | |
| 1 | Greater Mumbai | 12442373 | 143304 | 11.52 |
| 2 | Nagpur | 2447494 | 6827 | 2.79 |
| 3 | Thane | 1841488 | 10035 | 5.45 |
| 4 | Vasai-Virar | 1234690 | 2852 | 2.31 |
| 5 | Pimpri-Chinchwad | 1727692 | 11436 | 6.62 |
| 6 | Nashik | 1486053 | 5089 | 3.42 |
| 7 | Amravati | 647057 | 2815 | 4.35 |
| 8 | Latur | 382940 | 1246 | 3.25 |
| Municipal Councils and Nagar Panchayats | | | | |
| 9 | Kulgaon-Badlapur | 174226 | 372 | 2.14 |
| 10 | Khopoli | 71141 | 601 | 8.45 |
| 11 | Alibaug | 20743 | 84 | 4.05 |
| 12 | Murbad | 21080 | 29 | 1.38 |
| 13 | Tala | 6981 | 21 | 3.01 |
| 14 | Ichalkaranji | 292060 | 1928 | 6.60 |
| 15 | Barshi | 118722 | 456 | 3.84 |
| 16 | Talegaon-Dabhade | 56435 | 139 | 2.46 |
| 17 | Mahabaleshwar | 13393 | 207 | 15.46 |
| 18 | Malkapur | 31671 | 123 | 3.88 |
| 19 | Shirala | 15665 | 28 | 1.79 |
| 20 | Medha | 4678 | 18 | 3.85 |
| 21 | Nandurbar | 111037 | 498 | 4.48 |
| 22 | Sinnar | 65299 | 163 | 2.5 |
| 23 | Chopada | 72783 | 242 | 3.32 |
| 24 | Trimbak | 13383 | 66 | 4.93 |
| 25 | Sindkhed | 24566 | 53 | 2.16 |
| 26 | Sakri | 21007 | 50 | 2.38 |
| 27 | Osmanabad | 111825 | 39 | 0.35 |
| 28 | Jalna | 285577 | 917 | 3.21 |
| 29 | Sillod | 58230 | 120 | 2.06 |
| 30 | Khultabad | 15749 | 84 | 5.33 |
| 31 | Nilanga | 36172 | 79 | 2.18 |
| 32 | Renapur | 19277 | 30 | 1.56 |
| 33 | Shirur Anantpal | 10417 | 29 | 2.78 |
| 34 | Hinganghat | 101805 | 389 | 3.82 |
| 35 | Katol | 43267 | 267 | 6.17 |
| 36 | Ramtek | 22310 | 63 | 2.82 |
| 37 | Mohadi | 10526 | 30 | 2.85 |
| 38 | Lakhani | 12636 | 28 | 2.22 |
| 39 | Yavatmal | 248939 | 284 | 1.14 |
| 40 | Khamgaon | 94191 | 542 | 5.75 |
| 41 | Nandura | 44419 | 221 | 4.98 |
| 42 | Dhamangaon | 21059 | 49 | 2.33 |
| 43 | Bhatkuli | 8816 | 19 | 2.16 |
| 44 | Motala | 10331 | 28 | 2.71 |

Source: Information obtained from ULBs

Appendix 7.1
(Reference Paragraph 7.1.1 to 7.1.5)
Achievement against Service Level Benchmarks fixed by Government of India in
test-checked ULBs

| Sr. No. | Name of ULB | Coverage of water supply connections (%) | Per capita Availability of water (LPCD) | Extent of metering of water connection (%) | Quality of water supply (%) | Cost recovery in water supply services (%) | Efficiency in collection of water supply related charges (%) |
|-------------------------------|---------------------------------|--|---|--|-----------------------------|--|--|
| | Service Level Benchmarks | 100 | 135 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 90 |
| Municipal Corporations | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Greater Mumbai | 100 | 135.5 | 45.9 | 99.9 | 74.1 | 12.1 |
| 2 | Nagpur | 84 | 137.73 | 90 | 97 | 62.83 | 91.26 |
| 3 | Thane | 95 | 133 | 35 | 93.8 | 67 | 68.5 |
| 4 | Vasai-Virar | 80 | 110 | 0 | 100 | 53.78 | 62 |
| 5 | Pimpri-Chinchwad | 97 | 96.79 | 91.9 | 99.81 | 81.1 | 48.12 |
| 6 | Nashik | 97 | 210 | 98 | 100 | 77 | 41 |
| 7 | Amravati** | 90 | 135 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 60 |
| 8 | Latur | 62.3 | 82.5 | 0 | 27.70 | 119.1 | 21.2 |
| Municipal Councils | | | | | | | |
| 9 | Kulgaon-Badlapur** | 92.1 | 85.57 | 92 | 100 | 117.6 | 91.19 |
| 10 | Khopoli | 98.3 | 124 | 0 | 100 | 27.9 | 71.6 |
| 11 | Alibaug | 90 | 135 | 60 | 90 | NA | NA |
| 12 | Ichalkaranji | 100 | 90 | 0 | 100 | NA | 65.46 |
| 13 | Barshi | 67 | 110 | 0 | 60 | 80 | 65 |
| 14 | Talegaon-Dabhade | 97 | 135 | 30 | 100 | NA | 70 |
| 15 | Mahabaleshwar | 100 | 135 | 100 | 100 | 40.35 | 78.69 |
| 16 | Malkapur | 100 | 125-135 | 100 | 100 | 96 | 96 |
| 17 | Nandurbar | 96 | 135 | 0 | 100 | 38 | 40 |
| 18 | Sinnar | 72.3 | 78.1 | 34.4 | 99.6 | 80.5 | 29.2 |
| 19 | Chopada | 100 | 100 | 0 | 100 | 100 | 77.22 |
| 20 | Trimbak | 98.64 | 135 | NA | 100 | 0 | 90 |
| 21 | Osmanabad | 90 | 135 | 0 | 100 | 80 | 35 |
| 22 | Jalna | 80 | 80 | 0 | 100 | 11 | 20 |
| 23 | Sillod | 95 | 100 | 0 | 100 | 75 | 50 |
| 24 | Khultabad | 71 | 70 | NA | 100 | 78.8 | 85 |
| 25 | Nilanga | 50.3 | 71.3 | NA | 91 | 27.7 | 82.1 |
| 26 | Hinganghat | 70 | 70 | 0 | 95 | 50 | 80 |
| 27 | Katol | 74.5 | 142 | 0 | 100 | 53.6 | 51.6 |
| 28 | Ramtek | 80 | 70 | 100 | 95 | 60 | 60 |
| 29 | Yavatmal** | NA | NA | NA | NA | NA | NA |
| 30 | Khamgaon | 55 | 70 | 0 | NA | NA | NA |
| 31 | Nandura | 55 | 70 | 0 | 100 | 22 | 55 |
| 32 | Dhamangaon | 50 | 90 | 0 | 99 | 85 | 60 |
| Nagar Panchayats | | | | | | | |
| 33 | Tala | 100 | 120 | 0 | NA | 71 | 44 |
| 34 | Shirala | 98.7 | 86.1 | 0 | 100 | 70.9 | 43.8 |
| 35 | Medha | 72 | 209 | 0 | 100 | 0 | 102 |
| 36 | Sindkhed | 52 | 45 | 0 | 100 | 16.4 | 7.68 |
| 37 | Sakri | 72.3 | 50 | 0 | 100 | 67 | 30.73 |
| 38 | Renapur | 78.5 | 80.2 | 0 | 96.9 | 46 | 11.1 |
| 39 | Shirur Anantpal | 63 | 75.3 | 0 | 98 | 67.7 | 11.4 |
| 40 | Mohadi | 62 | 70 | 0 | 70 | 70 | 20 |
| 41 | Lakhani | 80 | 50 | 0 | 50 | 50 | 70 |
| 42 | Bhatkuli** | NA | NA | NA | NA | NA | NA |
| 43 | Motala | 88.5 | 47.6 | 0 | 68 | 46 | 0 |
| 44 | Murbad | 100 | 104 | 0 | 87 | 69.29 | 43 |

Source: Information obtained from ULBs

**In Kulgaon-Badlapur, Amravati, Yavatmal and Bhatkuli water supply services was being provided by MJP

NA means information not furnished by ULBs

Appendix 7.2

(Reference Paragraph 7.1.1 to 7.1.5)

Achievements against Service Level Benchmarks fixed by ULBs

| Sr. No. | Name of ULB | Coverage of water supply connections (%) | | Per capita Availability of water (LPCD) | | Extent of metering of water connection (%) | | Quality of water supply (%) | | Cost recovery in WS services (%) | | Efficiency in collection of WS related charges (%) | |
|-------------------------------|------------------|--|-----|---|-----|--|-----|-----------------------------|-----|----------------------------------|-----|--|----|
| | | T | A | T | A | T | A | T | A | T | A | T | A |
| Municipal Councils | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Kulgaon-Badlapur | 100 | 92 | 110 | 86 | 100 | 92 | 100 | 100 | 150 | 118 | 100 | 91 |
| 2 | Khopoli | 100 | 98 | 135 | 123 | 0 | NA | 100 | 100 | 50 | 28 | 100 | 72 |
| 3 | Alibaug | 100 | 100 | 187 | 184 | 35 | 27 | 85 | 99 | 50 | 46 | 75 | 67 |
| 4 | Ichalkaranji | 75 | 72 | 105 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 100 | 100 | 43 | 46 | 64 | 60 |
| 5 | Barshi | 80 | 76 | 110 | 107 | 0 | NA | 100 | 100 | 80 | 78 | 65 | 51 |
| 6 | Talegaon-Dabhade | 65 | 97 | 195 | 178 | 25 | 18 | 100 | 100 | 90 | 107 | 40 | 58 |
| 7 | Mahabaleshwar | 85 | 81 | 135 | 99 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 74 | 96 | 59 | 100 | 82 |
| 8 | Malkapur | 100 | 100 | 135 | 126 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 137 | 117 | 89 | 83 |
| 9 | Nandurbar | 78 | 78 | 82 | 79 | 0 | NA | 100 | 100 | 105 | 90 | 58 | 57 |
| 10 | Sinnar | 75 | 90 | 85 | 140 | 38 | 0 | 100 | 96 | 85 | 48 | 32 | 25 |
| 11 | Chopada | 60 | 54 | 90 | 73 | NA | NA | 100 | 100 | 72 | 72 | 55 | 32 |
| 12 | Trimbak | 100 | 100 | 138 | 121 | 2 | 2 | 100 | 100 | 37 | 39 | 70 | 43 |
| 13 | Osmanabad | 60 | 60 | 50 | 55 | 1 | 0 | 100 | 97 | 75 | 74 | 25 | 35 |
| 14 | Jalna | 54 | 48 | 40 | 40 | 0 | NA | 100 | 98 | 75 | 32 | 40 | 32 |
| 15 | Sillod | 61 | 65 | 56 | 60 | 0 | NA | 100 | 96 | 74 | 119 | 48 | 24 |
| 16 | Khultabad | 70 | 72 | 115 | 114 | 0 | NA | 100 | 97 | 40 | 34 | 80 | 80 |
| 17 | Nilanga | 60 | 55 | 85 | 74 | 0 | NA | 96 | 97 | 50 | 26 | 90 | 82 |
| 18 | Hinganghat | 61 | 57 | 94 | 91 | 0 | NA | 100 | 100 | 89 | 97 | 20 | 16 |
| 19 | Katol | 80 | 75 | 145 | 142 | 0 | NA | 100 | 100 | 65 | 54 | 92 | 52 |
| 20 | Ramtek | 65 | 60 | 60 | 56 | 100 | 94 | 99 | 98 | 32 | 32 | 94 | 90 |
| 21 | Yavatmal | 75 | 73 | 75 | 67 | 100 | 99 | 100 | 87 | 150 | 139 | 36 | 34 |
| 22 | Khamgaon | 45 | 51 | 65 | 54 | 50 | 0 | 100 | 100 | 50 | 32 | 55 | 62 |
| 23 | Nandura | 60 | 53 | 65 | 68 | 0 | NA | 100 | 100 | 50 | 51 | 65 | 11 |
| 24 | Dhamangaon | 65 | 52 | 98 | 90 | 0 | NA | 100 | 100 | 80 | 33 | 95 | 58 |
| Nagar Panchayats | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 25 | Tala | 100 | 100 | 130 | 120 | 0 | NA | 100 | ND | 100 | 71 | 90 | 44 |
| 26 | Shirala | 100 | 99 | 90 | 86 | 0 | NA | 100 | 100 | 78 | 71 | 50 | 44 |
| 27 | Medha | 70 | 72 | 172 | 209 | 0 | NA | 100 | 100 | 110 | 102 | 55 | 65 |
| 28 | Sindkhed | 56 | 52 | 45 | 41 | 0 | NA | 100 | 100 | 35 | 16 | 28 | 35 |
| 29 | Sakri | 65 | 62 | 35 | 31 | NA | NA | 100 | 100 | 40 | 31 | 40 | 18 |
| 30 | Renapur | 80 | 79 | 85 | 80 | 0 | NA | 90 | 97 | 45 | 46 | 20 | 11 |
| 31 | Shirur Anantpal | 77 | 63 | 77 | 75 | 0 | NA | 98 | 98 | 91 | 68 | 26 | 11 |
| 32 | Mohadi | 68 | 62 | 45 | 39 | 0 | NA | 20 | ND | 45 | 47 | 56 | 51 |
| 33 | Lakhni | 100 | 100 | 75 | 68 | 0 | NA | 40 | ND | 50 | 36 | 100 | 66 |
| 34 | Bhatkuli | 85 | ND | 65 | ND | 98 | ND | 76 | ND | 75 | ND | 5 | ND |
| 35 | Motala | 100 | 89 | 55 | 44 | 0 | NA | 100 | 100 | 95 | 94 | 85 | 80 |
| 36 | Murbad | 100 | 100 | 110 | 104 | 25 | NA | 100 | 100 | 140 | 72 | 80 | 43 |
| Municipal Corporations | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 37 | Nagpur | NP | 76 | NP | 85 | NP | 80 | NP | 99 | NP | 67 | NP | 83 |
| 38 | Thane | NP | 95 | NP | 133 | NP | 31 | NP | 94 | NP | 81 | NP | 49 |
| 39 | Vasai-Virar | NP | 74 | NP | 80 | NP | NA | NP | 98 | NP | 77 | NP | 68 |
| 40 | Pimpri-Chinchwad | NP | 97 | NP | 97 | NP | 92 | NP | 100 | NP | 81 | NP | 48 |
| 41 | Nashik | NP | 47 | NP | 105 | NP | 90 | NP | 93 | NP | 76 | NP | 52 |
| 42 | Amravati | 80 | 70 | 135 | 114 | 95 | 94 | 100 | 100 | 205 | 196 | 55 | 49 |
| 43 | Latur | 75 | 62 | 90 | 82 | 0 | 0 | 100 | 100 | 80 | 119 | 13 | 21 |
| 44 | Greater Mumbai | NP | 100 | NP | 135 | NP | 46 | NP | 100 | NP | 74 | NP | 12 |

Source: Information compiled from notification dated 20 November 2019 and 08 February 2021 of UDD Government of Maharashtra
The difference in achievement reported by the ULBs and as reported in the notification is not reconciled
Note: NA: Not available; ND: No data; NP: not published in the notification,
T: Target; A: Achievement

Appendix 7.3.
(Reference Paragraph 7.2.1 to 7.2.5)
Achievement against Service Level Benchmarks fixed by Government of India in
test-checked ULBs

| Sr. No. | Name of ULB | Coverage of toilets (%) | Coverage of sewage network services (%) | Collection efficiency of sewage network (%) | Adequacy of sewage treatment capacity (%) | Quality of Sewage treatment (%) |
|-------------------------------|------------------|-------------------------|---|---|---|---------------------------------|
| Service Level Benchmarks | | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 |
| Municipal Corporations | | | | | | |
| 1 | Greater Mumbai | 100 | 80.9 | 72.73 | 43.8 | 85.7 |
| 2 | Nagpur | 100 | 70 | 70 | 65 | 94.12 |
| 3 | Thane | 100 | 66.3 | 41.2 | 100 | 100 |
| 4 | Vasai-Virar | 100 | 13 | 13 | 16.22 | 17 |
| 5 | Pimpri-Chinchwad | 100 | 83.53 | 88.14 | 88.14 | 100 |
| 6 | Nashik | 100 | 97.68 | 100 | 100 | 99 |
| 7 | Amravati | 100 | 3.12 | 11 | 11 | 07 |
| 8 | Latur | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Municipal Councils | | | | | | |
| 9 | Kulgaon-Badlapur | 100 | 60 | 50 | 80 | 100 |
| 10 | Khopoli | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 11 | Alibaug | 100 | 90 | 70 | 0 | 0 |
| 12 | Ichalkaranji | 100 | 50 | 100 | 40 | 100 |
| 13 | Barshi | 100 | 0 | NA | NA | NA |
| 14 | Talegaon-Dabhade | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 15 | Mahabaleshwar | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 |
| 16 | Malkapur | 100 | 80 | 100 | 100 | 100 |
| 17 | Nandurbar | 100 | 90 | 100 | 100 | 3 |
| 18 | Sinnar | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 19 | Chopada | 100 | NA | NA | NA | NA |
| 20 | Trimbak | 92 | 25 | 70 | 70 | 30 |
| 21 | Osmanabad | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 22 | Jalna | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 98.4 |
| 23 | Sillod | 95 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 24 | Khultabad | 100 | 0 | NA | NA | NA |
| 25 | Nilanga | 100 | 0 | NA | NA | NA |
| 26 | Hinganghat | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 27 | Katol | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 28 | Ramtek | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 29 | Yavatmal | 90-95 | 90-95 | NA | NA | NA |
| 30 | Khamgaon | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA |
| 31 | Nandura | 100 | 0 | 0 | 10 | 0 |
| 32 | Dhamangaon | 100 | NA | NA | NA | 0 |
| Nagar Panchayat | | | | | | |
| 33 | Tala | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 34 | Shirala | 100 | 0 | NA | NA | NA |
| 35 | Medha | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 36 | Sindkhed | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 37 | Sakri | 100 | 6.4 | NA | NA | NA |
| 38 | Renapur | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 39 | Shirur-Anantpal | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 40 | Mohadi | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 41 | Lakhani | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 42 | Bhatkuli | 100 | 0 | NA | NA | NA |
| 43 | Motala | 100 | 0 | NA | NA | NA |
| 44 | Murbad | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

Source: Information obtained from ULBs
NA means information not furnished by ULBs

Appendix 7.4
(Reference Paragraph 7.2.1 to 7.2.5)

Achievement against Service Level Benchmarks fixed by ULBs

| Sr. No. | Name of ULB | Coverage of toilets | | Coverage of sewerage network services | | Collection efficiency of sewerage network | | Adequacy of sewage treatment capacity | | Quality of sewage treatment | |
|-------------------------------|------------------|---------------------|-----|---------------------------------------|----|---|-----|---------------------------------------|-----|-----------------------------|-----|
| | | T | A | T | A | T | A | T | A | T | A |
| Municipal Corporations | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Greater Mumbai | NP | 100 | NP | 81 | NP | 20 | NP | 44 | NP | 86 |
| 2 | Nagpur | NP | 98 | NP | 89 | NP | 98 | NP | 117 | NP | 100 |
| 3 | Thane | NP | 99 | NP | 76 | NP | 41 | NP | 76 | NP | 100 |
| 4 | Vasai-Virar | NP | 100 | NP | 4 | NP | 13 | NP | 23 | NP | 100 |
| 5 | Pimpri-Chinchwad | NP | 100 | NP | 83 | NP | 100 | NP | 131 | NP | 100 |
| 6 | Nashik | NP | 100 | NP | 95 | NP | 59 | NP | 59 | NP | ND |
| 7 | Amravati | 100 | 100 | 5 | 3 | 20 | 41 | 110 | 101 | 100 | 100 |
| 8 | Latur | 100 | 100 | 25 | 7 | 25 | 0 | 50 | 0 | 50 | NA |
| Municipal Councils | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 9 | Kulgaon-Badlapur | 100 | 100 | 75 | 57 | 75 | 77 | 100 | 79 | 100 | 96 |
| 10 | Khopoli | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 11 | Alibaug | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 12 | Ichalkaranji | 100 | 100 | 43 | 41 | 60 | 59 | 63 | 59 | 100 | 100 |
| 13 | Barshi | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 14 | Talegaon-Dabhade | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 15 | Mahabaleshwar | 100 | 100 | 95 | 95 | 95 | 100 | 80 | 51 | 100 | 100 |
| 16 | Malkapur | 100 | 100 | 0 | 48 | 0 | 100 | 0 | 179 | 0 | 100 |
| 17 | Nandurbar | 100 | 100 | 0 | 85 | 0 | 99 | 0 | 176 | 0 | 100 |
| 18 | Sinnar | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 19 | Chopada | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | NA | NA | NA | NA | NA | NA |
| 20 | Trimbak | 100 | 100 | 79 | 74 | 56 | 57 | 55 | 57 | 0 | 100 |
| 21 | Osmanabad | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 22 | Jalna | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 23 | Sillod | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 24 | Khultabad | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 25 | Nilanga | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 26 | Hinganghat | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 27 | Katol | 100 | 100 | 20 | 0 | 20 | NA | 20 | NA | 20 | NA |
| 28 | Ramtek | 100 | 99 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 29 | Yavatmal | 100 | 98 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 30 | Khamgaon | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 31 | Nandura | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 32 | Dhamangaon | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| Nagar Panchayats | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 33 | Bhatkuli | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 34 | Motala | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 35 | Murbad | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 36 | Tala | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 37 | Shirala | 100 | 100 | NA | 0 | NA | NA | NA | NA | NA | NA |
| 38 | Medha | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 39 | Sindkhed | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 40 | Sakri | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | NA | NA | NA | NA | NA | NA |
| 41 | Renapur | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 42 | Shirur Anantpal | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | NA | NA | NA | NA | NA | NA |
| 43 | Mohadi | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |
| 44 | Lakhani | 100 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | NA | 0 | NA | 0 | NA |

Source: Information compiled from notification dated 08 February 2021 of UDD, Government of Maharashtra. Difference in achievement reported by the ULBs to audit and as reported in the notification is not reconciled. Note: NA: Not available; ND: No data; NP: Not published in the notification, T: Target, A: Achievement

Appendix 7.5
(Reference: Paragraph 7.3.3)
Shortage of fire stations in test-checked ULBs

| Sr. No. | Name of the ULB | Fire stations required | Fire station available | Shortage of fire stations |
|---|------------------|------------------------|------------------------|---------------------------|
| Municipal Corporation | | | | |
| 1 | Thane | 14 | 8 | 6 |
| 2 | Virar-Vasai | 12 | 7 | 5 |
| 3 | Pimpri-Chinchwad | 18 | 6 | 12 |
| 4 | Nashik | 21 | 6 | 15 |
| 5 | Nagpur | 22 | 9 | 13 |
| 6 | Amaravati | 12 | 4 | 8 |
| 7 | Latur | 4 | 2 | 2 |
| Municipal Councils/ Nagar Panchayats | | | | |
| 1 | Kugaon-Badlapur | 3 | 1 | 2 |
| 2 | Yavatmal | 2 | 1 | 1 |
| 3 | Murbad | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 4 | Tala | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 5 | Sakri | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 6 | Medha | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 7 | Sinnar | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 8 | Ichalkaranji | 3 | 2 | 1 |
| 9 | Jalna | 3 | 1 | 2 |
| 10 | Renapur | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Total | | 120 | 47 | 73 |
| <i>Note: Osmanabad, Nandurbar, Trimbak, Khultabad, Alibaug, Shirur-Anantapal, Shirala, Lakhani, Motala, Sindkhed ULBs did not furnish information</i> | | | | |

