

# CHAPTER-5

## Monitoring Mechanism

### 5.1 Introduction

The TSP guideline envisaged that central ministries/departments will be responsible for monitoring compliance with TSP component of Centrally Sponsored Schemes. The Planning Commission was to monitor the progress of TSP at the time of half yearly and annual performance reviews of the ministries/departments. The nodal dedicated unit of the respective ministry was to ensure that funds are released to the concerned implementing agency timely which in turn was to release funds to their field level implementing agencies. Dissemination of information to STs about the schemes/programmes available for their development was the responsibility of the nodal dedicated unit of STs in the ministries. The dedicated units also ensure follow up of the schemes implemented and maintenance of proper records on assets created under TSP in the Ministry.

### 5.2 Shortcomings in monitoring mechanism

#### A. Central ministries//departments

#### 5.2.1 Non-functional dedicated TSP unit and non-monitoring of Quarterly Progress Report by Planning Commission

The Planning Commission identified 28 Central Ministries which have been earmarking allocation in proportion to the population of STs and releasing TSP fund in their various schemes/programmes, since 2011-12. The details of overall total outlay and expenditure during 2011-12 to 2013-14 were as under:-

Year	Total Outlay (BE)	Total Expenditure (Actual)
2011-12	18091.23	17453.60
2012-13	21710.11	20184.10
2013-14	24598.39	22029.97 (RE)

Source: Expenditure Budget Volume-I, 2014-15

Audit found that the dedicated TSP unit which was set up earlier since

November 2005 was not functioning in the Planning Commission though the expenditure on TSP rose from ₹ 17453.60 crore to ₹ 22029.97 crore during the year 2011-12 to 2013-14.

The Planning Commission informed (November 2014) that work which was supposed to be carried out by a separate cell had been assigned to Social Justice and Empowerment Division (SJ&E) of the Planning Commission. However, this division was not in a position to perform the function properly due to inadequate staffing. Hence, the dedicated unit in the Planning Commission for monitoring TSP continued to remain non-functional. Meanwhile, the Prime Minister's Office requested (March 2013) the Planning Commission to monitor expenditure under SCSP and TSP every quarter. Accordingly the Planning Commission requested (October 2013) all concerned ministries/department to furnish scheme-wise consolidated physical and financial progress report under TSP schemes/programmes of their ministry/department by the first week of every quarter of the financial year. Audit observed that out of the 28 identified ministries/departments only two departments i.e Department of Agriculture and Department of Rural Development furnished the report for the 1<sup>st</sup> quarter i.e. April 2014 to June 2014. No other ministry/department had submitted the progress reports to the Planning Commission.

The Planning Commission further stated (November 2014) that it had repeatedly requested the implementing ministries to furnish the progress reports but did not receive adequate response from many ministries. The Social Justice & Empowerment Division dealing with the implementing ministries had also taken up the matter with the nodal division/subject matter divisions in the Planning Commission also but the response was very poor.

Thus, despite PMO's direction the Planning Commission (now Neeti Aayog) could hardly monitor the implementation of TSP and utilisation of funds.

### **5.2.2 Non formation of Nodal Unit in the Ministry of Tribal Affairs**

The Ministry of Tribal Affairs was to be associated at the planning stage at the time of preparation of Annual Plans of the central ministries /departments for allocation of funds under TSP. The ministry had not been given any direct role at the monitoring stage. It was to, however, set up a dedicated nodal unit like all other central ministries to monitor

implementation of funds under TSP released by it. The ministry had incurred an expenditure of ₹ 10502.66 crore during the period 2011-12 to 2013-14 under the Tribal Sub-Plan. The year wise details of allocation and expenditure of funds under TSP in respect of Ministry was as under:-

( ₹ in crore)			
Year	BE	RE	Expenditure
2011-12	3723.01	3723.01	3623.87
2012-13	4090.00	3100.00	3056.68
2013-14	4279.00	3879.00	3822.11
<b>Total</b>	<b>12092.01</b>	<b>10702.01</b>	<b>10502.66</b>

Audit found that no nodal unit existed in even in this Ministry. In response to audit query the Ministry replied (October 2014), that specific TSP Nodal Unit had not been set up in the Ministry for monitoring the TSP Funds but the budgetary provisions for the scheme of the Ministry was made under the budget head 796 and different sections/divisions of the ministry monitor/administer their respective schemes/programmes.

The reply of the Ministry is not acceptable as the nodal unit had to perform the specific task of implementation and monitoring of the TSP funds in totality.

### **5.2.3 Non establishment of Sub Plan Research Centre and non formation of Scheduled Tribe Education Management Information System (SEMIS) in the Ministry of Human Resource Development**

As per para 2 (iv) (e) of the Ministry's guidelines (01 October 2013) a Sub Plan Research Centre was to be established to carry out studies and gap analysis for identifying priorities of investment under the TSP. The Centre was required to maintain state wise, scheme wise and beneficiary wise details through the nodal units of organizations/bureaus by setting up a web portal for tracking the progress of the implementation, expenditure, output and outcome indicators as prescribed under TSP. Further according to para 2(iv) (f), a dedicated STs education website hosted in the government server was to be developed with the twin objective of (i) disseminating information about the various education schemes and programmes of the Ministry of HRD and all States/UTs education departments that are earmarking funds under TSP each year. (ii) tracking

SC/ST students from school education through to higher education including their access to educational needs such as scholarship, uniforms, textbooks etc. This website was to be developed in English as well as in all the official languages of states/UTs. Entire data on schemes and earmarking of funds under TSP each year was to be available on the web site.

Audit noticed that neither Sub Plan Research Centre was established nor SEMIS had been developed by the Indian Council of Social Science and Research (ICSSR) as envisaged. The ICSSR in its reply (September 2014) stated that para 2 (iv) (f) of guideline did not mention anything about the role of ICSSR to develop SEMIS whereas Ministry of HRD, Department of Higher Education (February 2014) directed ICSSR for Action Taken Report (ATR) on these actionable points.

Thus, the Ministry failed to develop the framework for monitoring TSP funds as planned by it. There was lack of communication with ICSSR and no monitoring system was available (October 2014).

#### **5.2.4 Inadequate monitoring by monitoring committees in MHRD**

##### **(a) National Monitoring Committee**

As per Resolution of the National Monitoring Committee, the Committee was to act as a permanent body and advise the government on all matters pertaining to education as well as review the functioning of various schemes launched by the Ministry for the purpose of promoting SCs/STs and PWDs in education. The Committee was to meet as often as required but at least once a year i.e on 27<sup>th</sup> June each year.

Audit observed that NMC held meeting during 2012-13 and 2013-14; but after June 2013 no meetings were conducted by the NMC.

##### **(c) Standing Committee**

As per order of July 2012 of constitution of a Standing Committee of the NMC for education of SCs/STs/PWDs, the Committee was to advise the NMC on the educational development and to monitor, implementation of schemes aimed at educational opportunities. The Standing Committee was to determine its own procedure and meet as often as necessary but at least twice a year.

Audit observed that during the year 2013-14, only one meeting was conducted in the month of January 2014.

### **5.2.5 Non-constitution of dedicated unit in the Department of Health & Family Welfare (Ministry of Health & Family Welfare)**

Audit noticed that no such dedicated unit had been formed in the Department of Health & Family Welfare as provided under the 2010 guideline.

The Department stated (September 2014) that the TDP Cell was set up in 1981 and since then various developments had taken place in the area of health care. They explained that after launching of the National Rural Health Mission (NRHM) in 2005 and its modification to National Health Mission (NHM) in 2013, health interventions in respect of Tribal and people in Left Wing Extremism (LWE) affected areas are addressed and monitoring and evaluation is conducted under the NHM framework. The reply of the department does not indicate as to how the monitoring of TSP funds to be conducted by the dedicated nodal unit with special focus on tribals was ensured.

Audit also noticed that the Department has released ` 4395.32crore under the head Tribal Sub-Plan '796' for implementation of the three schemes i.e. Infrastructure Maintenance, Immunisation (Pulse Polio Immunisation), Flexible Pool for State PIPs-RCH Flexible Pool and Mission Flexible Pool during the period 2011-12 to 2013-14 but no monitoring measures were undertaken by the Ministry.

### **5.2.6 Improper functioning of nodal dedicated unit in AYUSH**

Audit noticed that the Department of AYUSH identified its budget division as nodal unit for TSP which dealt with only earmarking of funds. No separate dedicated unit had been set up for implementing and monitoring the expenditure out of the allotted funds under TSP.

In its reply, department stated (October 2014) that the budget division had been identified as nodal unit for TSP earmarking and implementation as also its monitoring since April 2014, but mechanism to monitor the work for allocation/utilization of the TSP funds was under process.

## **B Central Level Autonomous Bodies**

Ministry of HRD, Department of Higher Education issued guidelines on implementation of TSP to all concerned departments (October 2013). These guidelines provided that all organizations under the administrative control of the Ministry would designate a nodal unit or a committee or

Project Approval Board (PAB) to oversee the implementation of TSP in their respective organisations/programmes. These units/committees/PABs after estimating the gap in the educational development of STs through a consultative process, shall prepare TSP in respect of their organisation/schemes with approval of the competent authority.

The following table summarises the findings in the central ABs under MHRD and AYUSH:

Central ABs	Audit findings
UGC	Audit observed that even after the formulation of nodal unit (October 2013), only two meetings were held i.e. on May 2014 and June 2014 and draft guidelines on implementation of TSP in UGC had been finalised and forwarded to the ministry (April 2014) for approval. The approval of the guidelines from the ministry was still awaited (April 2015).
AICTE	Audit noticed that no such dedicated unit had been formed in the AICTE as of September 2014. Hence, in the absence of such monitoring unit the work to oversee the implementation of TSP and preparation of estimation of gap in the educational development of STs which was required to be sent to the NMC could not be undertaken.
IGNOU	The IGNOU had set up a Committee in October 2013 and the first meeting was held in December 2013 for implementation of the scheme wherein it was decided that detailed structure of specific schemes/programmes for direct benefit of the students of Schedule Tribes was to be worked out by the concerned division/unit and once, in principle, approval was given by the competent authority, the same would be placed for its approval. Audit noticed that except the first meeting no other meeting was further held. As decided, the detailed structure of schemes/programmes benefiting STs was also not processed or placed before the appropriate authorities for approval. Hence, the TSP fund of ₹ 10.17 crore released by the MHRD during 2011-14 was utilised fully but without

	any planning for tribals' benefit.
<b>CCRAS/CCRUM/ CCRH</b>	Audit noticed that no dedicated unit was formed in the CCRUM, CCRH and CCRAS. Department (CCRH, CCRUM and CCRAS) accepted the observation and stated (July 2015) that a nodal officer had been identified to look after the affairs of TSP.

### 5.2.7 Monitoring of TSP fund by States

Due to substantial amount of TSP fund involved in the implementation of schemes selected for audit, the monitoring and evaluation of the schemes required a robust and efficient monitoring mechanism as per the scheme guidelines. It was to be carried out at the state level by the state implementing agencies. Poor monitoring was noted during audit at the state level also as evident from lack of MIS, non-availability of any monitoring formats, etc. The important point was that there was no concept of monitoring TSP separately. The details are in **Annex 46(i) & 46(ii)**.

Due to coverage of a wide range of programmes and activities under Tribal Sub Plan and complex nature of flow of information required from 28 ministries/departments, its monitoring requires a special frame work to capture the progress in a holistic manner. It is clear from the audit findings in this chapter that the nodal units envisaged for linking the progress and overall monitoring were mostly non-functional.

#### **Recommendations:**

- ❖ *Dedicated nodal units for formulation, implementation and monitoring of TSP components under each ministry/department should be made functional and oversight role of Ministry of Tribal Affairs should be strengthened in the overall monitoring framework of TSP.*
- ❖ *Evaluation studies to assess the impact of TSP on socio economic development of STs should be conducted and findings of such studies should be used as input for planning process.*