

Chapter-8 Human Resource Management and Internal Control System

8.1 Human Resource Management

The sufficiency of staff is necessary for successful implementation of schemes/ programmes. The overall Sanctioned Strength (SS) and Men-in-Position (MIP) of all the departments in the district was not available. However, data relating to 21 line departments out of 52 line departments of Nainital District was compiled (2012) by the District Economic & Statistical Officer as shown in **Table 8.1** below:

Table 8.1: Details of Sanctioned Strength and Men in Position of 21 departments of Nainital District

Sl. No.	Department	Group-‘A’ & ‘B’			Group-‘C’ & ‘D’		
		Sanctioned Strength	Men in Position	Shortage (per cent)	Sanctioned Strength	Men in Position	Shortage (per cent)
1	Line departments	753	603	150(20)	9780	8273	1507(15)
2	PRIs	3	1	2(67)	506	135	371(73)
3	ULBs ¹⁰⁹	0	2	0	1446	904	542(37)
4	Other (UDWDP)	17	9	8(47)	28	29	-1
Total		773	615	160(20)	11760	9341	2419(21)

Source: District Economic & Statistical Officer

Audit noticed that even this data was not complete as information relating to various units within the 21 departments was not included. The shortage in these line departments ranged between 11 to 57 *per cent* for Group ‘A’ and ‘B’ cadre and 02 to 52 *per cent* in ‘C’ and ‘D’ cadre as shown in **Appendix–8.1**. The shortage was noticed especially in key posts, i.e. Assistant Engineers (AEs), Junior Engineers (JEs), Doctors, Teachers and *Gram Rojgar Sahayak* (GRS) as discussed in the subsequent paragraphs.

8.1.1 Non-revision of Sanctioned Strength

Test-check of selected departments/ divisions revealed that despite considerable increase in budgets¹¹⁰ for implementation of various schemes, the deployment of staff was not according to the sanctioned strength during 2007-08 to 2011-12 in respect of Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme (MGNREGS), Urban Local Bodies (ULBs), Forest, Nainital Lake Region Special Area Development Authority (NLRSA), Medical Department, District Ayurvedic & Unani Office, Uttarakhand Jal Nigam (UJN)/ Uttarakhand Jan Sansthan (UJS) and Uttarakhand Decentralised Watershed Development Project (UDWDP), as shown in the **Appendix–8.2**. The deficiency of staff ranged from 5 to 83 *per cent* against the Sanction Strength (SS) in these departments/ divisions. Besides, no revisions in the staff strength was done in respect of the test checked ULBs.

¹⁰⁹ {SS=ZP-49, GP-460} {MIP=ZP -38, GP-98}

¹¹⁰ ₹ 55.02 crore in 2007-08 and ₹ 80.12 crore in 2011-12

8.1.2 Shortage of key functionaries

The doctors and para medical staff are responsible for providing adequate health services to the people and perform its role as key functionaries in the Medical Health and Family Welfare Department, while Assistant Engineers (AE) and Junior Engineers (JE) are the key functionaries for executing civil works in various engineering departments which are executing different flagship schemes. The Range Officer, *Van Daroga* and Forest Guard are meant for protection of forest. Besides, *Gram Rozgar Sahayaks* are responsible for implementation of MGNREGS works at GP level. The shortage noticed against key posts is detailed in **Table 8.2** below:

Table - 8.2: Status of shortage in key posts

Name of selected schemes	Key Post	Sanctioned Strength	Men In position	Shortage	Percentage
Irrigation divisions	Assistant Engineer	14	13	1	07
	Junior Engineer	58	39	19	33
Medical Health & Family Welfare	Doctors	203	143	60	30
	X-Ray technician	13	5	8	62
	Lab Technician	24	16	8	33
	Pharmacist	93	82	11	12
Ayurvedic & Unani Office	Doctors	53	40	13	25
	Pharmacist	37	14	23	62
UJN & UJS	Assistant Engineer	23	15	8	35
	Junior Engineer	69	36	33	48
	Fitter & Draftsman	130	88	42	32
UDWDP (EAP)	Unit Officer	4	3	1	25
	Asstt. Development Officer	4	3	1	25
Forest Department	Ranger	51	11	40	78
	Dy. Ranger	92	69	23	25
	Van Daroga	337	205	132	39
	Forest Guard	923	510	413	45
	Surveyor	6	0	6	100
ULBs	Junior Engineer	2	1	1	50
	Sweeper	688	560	128	19
NLRSA	Assistant Engineer	3	1	2	67
	Junior Engineer	6	4	2	33
MGNREGS	Gram Rojgar Sahayak	115	4	111	97
	Junior Engineer	44	13	31	70

Source: Departments figures

Scrutiny of records revealed the following:

- In Minor Irrigation Division, Bhimtal, an AE was looking after the works of two sub-divisions (Nainital & Dhari) having responsibility for execution of 350 schemes

(₹ 17.38 crore) of five blocks during 2007-12. An Additional Assistant Engineer (AAE) was also looking after the charge of AE, Haldwani sub division and monitoring his own work of 201 schemes amounting to ₹ 19.60 crore. Further, the duty of Draughtsman, responsible for technical assistance to Executive Engineer, was being performed by a ministerial staff i.e. by Head Assistant;

- In NLRSA no Project Implementing Unit (PIU) was established as envisaged in the NLCP guidelines. Only one project engineer was deployed on contract basis for implementing the project works.

8.1.3 Capacity building-Training

Training is a continuous process for improvement of the skills of an organization's manpower. Training assumes greater significance in the public service departments because of rising public expectations.

Audit observed lack of/inadequate incidence of training under the selected schemes/ implementing departments and local bodies except in projects such as UDWD and SWAJAL, who had prepared their training plan and nominated the staff for training. The staff of MGNREG scheme was provided training only at the beginning of the scheme in the year 2007-08. While in NRDWQM & S, out of a total 655 functionaries of 131 GPs, 210 functionaries (32 per cent) had not been provided training. Moreover, in NRHM, 920 Accredited Social Health Activists (ASHA) against the total of 940 ASHAs were successfully trained up to March 2012.

8.2 Internal control

Internal control is an integral part of an organization's operations which provides an excellent tool for managers to ensure efficient, effective and economic utilisation of resources. It also ensures that financial interests and resources are safeguarded and reliable information is available to the administration. Internal audit (IA), as an independent entity, examines and evaluates the level of compliance to the Departmental rules and procedures and provides independent assurance to management on the adequacy or otherwise of the existing internal controls.

8.2.1 Internal audit

It was noticed that the audit of all the eight *Kshetra Panchayats* (KPs) of the district had not been conducted and the audit of *Gram Panchayats* (GPs) had declined from 85 to three since 2007-08 to 2011-12. The shortfall in conducting audit by District Local Fund Audit (DLFA) and Co-operative & Panchayat Audit (CPA) against the units planned during the period 2007-08 to 2011-12 ranged between 71 to 93 per cent and 45 to 62 per cent respectively as indicated in **Appendix-8.3**. A total number of 6,986 Audit paragraphs of DLFA and 7463 Paragraphs of CPA were outstanding as of March 2012. On this being pointed out, the District Local Fund Audit (DLFA) attributed the shortfall in conducting inspections to the shortage of manpower.

Scrutiny of internal audit in test checked schemes revealed that no records of Internal Audit (IA) existed in majority of the selected units. In NRHM the balance sheet was prepared by Chartered Accountants up to 2011-12. No details of internal audit were provided by the District Programme coordinator (DPC) in respect of MGNREG scheme.

8.2.2 Accounts and reconciliation

Effective management of accounts and reconciliation activities greatly increases the department's ability to proactively identify lapses, if any, and resolve other issues related to accounts. Accounting information and reconciliation enable the authorities to monitor the progress of receipts and expenditure under different schemes/ programmes.

Scrutiny of records of implementing agencies of selected schemes/ programme revealed the following deficiencies in the maintenance of accounts.

8.2.2.1 Multiple Bank Accounts: The departments, namely ULBs, UJS and NLRSAADA did not maintain scheme specific accounts and deposited the funds of various schemes in multiple bank accounts.

8.2.2.2 Bank Reconciliation Statement (BRS): BRSs were not maintained by six units namely NP Bhimtal, UJS Nainital, NLRSAADA, PHC Bhimtal, Female Hospital Haldwani and B D Pandey (Female) Hospital, Nainital. BRS for MGNREG scheme was also not maintained either at DPC, Blocks and GP level.

8.2.2.3 Accounting system: The Ministry of Urban Development, in consultation with the Comptroller & Auditor General of India, developed National Municipal Accounting Manual (NMAM) for double entry system of accounting for ULBs. None of the selected ULBs had adopted the same as of November 2012.

8.2.2.4 Cash Book: Cash Book of MGNREG scheme was not being made as per format in the DPC, Blocks and GPs.

8.2.2.5 Other Accounts: Minor Irrigation Bhimtal and Kosi Construction Division-2 Ramnagar did not maintain Form 63, in the absence of which, Audit could not ascertain and verify the actual expenditure incurred on various works/ schemes. Further, Female Hospital, Haldwani had not maintained the details of expenditure (₹1.78 Lakh) incurred in Pulse Polio programme. Moreover, vouchers were being made on plain papers and were not being countersigned/ certified by the Medical Officer-in-Charge.

8.2.3 Upkeep of records

Record keeping is a fundamental activity of public administration without which, there can be no rule of law and no accountability. Public servants must have information to carry out their work. Further, records provide a reliable and legally verifiable source of evidence of decisions and actions.

Scrutiny of records of implementing agencies of selected schemes/ programmes revealed the following:

- None of the test checked ULBs had updated their assets register.
- NPP Ramnagar maintained non-consumable and consumable stock in the same stock register. The ULB had not worked out the closing balance of the stocks nor verified stock as required by the financial rules.
- Minor Irrigation division, Bhimtal had neither maintained the assets register nor monitored the created assets. Further, the stock account had also not been updated since March 2008.
- The District Ayurvedic & Unani Officer (DAO), Nainital had not maintained the stock register as per prescribed norms, in the absence of which audit could not ascertain the closing balance of medicines.
- In MGNREGS, Job card registers were not maintained at *Bhavanipur Khulbe* and *Nathupur* GPs of Ramnagar Block while nine out of 24 selected GPs did not maintain the Muster Roll Receipt Registers. Thus, the Muster Rolls issued by the blocks could not be reconciled at GPs level.

8.2.4 Right to Information

Right to Information (RTI) was enacted in all the departments/ executing agencies and was working effectively. A total of 3661 RTIs, 161 appeals and 55 cases had been filed and disposed of, while in four cases the penalty was also imposed.

8.2.5 Citizens charter

As per “Citizens Right to Grievance Redress Bill, 2011” every public authority shall publish a Citizens Charter within six months of the commencement of the Act. Scrutiny of the records of public authorities in respect of sampled schemes¹¹¹ showed that DPC, Jal Sansthan, NLRSA and ULBs had not displayed citizens charter while in Medical Department, citizens charter was found to have been placed in two out of four selected PHCs and in three out of 24 selected Sub Centers only.

8.2.6 Public grievance mechanism

As per Citizens Right to Grievance Redress Bill, 2011 every public authority shall establish Information and Facilitation Centre for efficient and effective delivery of services and redressal of grievances which may include establishment of customer care centre, call center, help desk, people’s support center *etc.*

Audit scrutiny of the records of implementing agencies of the selected schemes revealed that no complaint registers were maintained in B. D Pandey Female Hospital, Nainital, CHC Bhowali and four PHCs¹¹². Similarly, no grievance redressal mechanism was found in existence in ULBs and NLRSA. However, UJS divisions had maintained complaint register and compliances

¹¹¹ MH&FW, UJBs, LDA and UJS.

¹¹² Bhimtal, Motahaldu, Bailparao and Ramgarh.

were made accordingly. Besides, a help line had been established at DPC level for Grievance Redressal of MGNREGS but no register was maintained for the same.

8.2.7 Monitoring Mechanism

The District Project Monitoring Committee (DPMC), in the absence of the statutory DPC, was required to review/monitor the progress of schemes on quarterly basis. In addition, the State Government constituted a District Task Force to supervise major flagship schemes in the district. Each member of the task force was to physically verify 25 units in a month. The details of target and achievement of inspections carried out by DPMC during the period 2007-12 is indicated in **Table 8.3** below:

Table 8.3: Detail of Monitoring by DPMC

Year	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12
Target	2400	2400	2400	2400	1800
Achievement (Per cent)	1234 (51)	911(38)	720(30)	1854(77)	1510(84)

Source: Records of DESTO

From the above table it may be seen that there was a shortfall in the supervision of schemes ranging between 16 to 17 *per cent* during 2007-08 to 2011-12. Scrutiny revealed that during 2010-12, members of the task force verified large numbers of units in the month of March which was disproportionate to the normative requirement of 25 units in a month. The DESTO stated that due to heavy departmental workload the targets could not be achieved. Besides, the DPMC convened only five meetings against the requirement of 20 during 2007-12. Thus, the monitoring and supervision of the progress of implementation of various schemes in the district was perfunctory.

Scrutiny of records revealed the following shortcomings in monitoring of the schemes/programmes:

- In MGNREGS only 4116 (59 *per cent*) works against total 6,976 were inspected at block level during period 2008-12.
- In NRHM no monitoring and planning committees were formed in the district, blocks and PHC. The Governing body of the DHS met only six times (2007-12) to assess and examine the implementation and progress of NRHM scheme as against the required 20 meetings.
- In NLCP no Steering Committee and Scientific Advisory committees were formed as required.
- Under Irrigation Department, the State Level Monitoring Cell and State Level Technical Advisory Committee for monitoring and evaluation of AIBP schemes were constituted in July 2011, after a lapse of eight years¹¹³ from the launch of the programme. Besides, inter-department coordination committee meant to coordinate all concerning departments to

¹¹³ From 2002-03 i.e. the year when AIBP launched in the State.

facilitate pre and post benefit of irrigation facility was constituted by State Government in January 2011, after nine years of launching of the scheme/ programme.

Recommendations

The State Government/ District Administration may consider to ensure:

- *Strengthening monitoring and supervision is strengthened at all the tiers of local district administration so that the programmes are executed on time and well within cost.*
- *Periodical assessment of sanctioned strength, postings of functionary at each level, especially in key post like doctors, engineers and forest security staff for smooth implementation of the programmes/ schemes.*