

ANNEXURE-I

(Referred to in Paragraph 1.9)

Position of outstanding ATNs

Ministry of Defence - excluding Ordnance Factory Board

(i) Pending for more than ten years

Sl.No.	Report No. and Year	Para No.	Subject
1.	Audit Report, Union Government (Defence Services) for the year 1985-86	34*	Loss due to delay in pointing out short/ defective supply.
2.	No.2 of 1988	9**	Purchase of Combat dress from trade.
3.	No. 2 of 1989	11**	Purchase and licence production of 155mm towed gun system and ammunition
4.	No.12 of 1990	9**	Contract with Bofors for (a) purchase and licence production of 155mm gun system and (b) Counter Trade
5.		10*	Induction and de-induction of a gun system.
6.		19*	Import of ammunition of old vintage.
7.		46**	Ration article-Dal.
8.	No.8 of 1991	10*	Procurement of stores in excess of requirement.
9.		13*	Central Ordnance Depot, Agra.
10.		17**	Infructuous expenditure on procurement of dal chana.
11.	No.8 of 1992	20**	Procurement of sub-standard goods in an Ordnance Depot.
12.		28**	Avoidable payment of maintenance charges for Defence tracks not in use.
13.	No. 8 of 1993	15**	Non-utilisation of assets.

Sl.No.	Report No. and Year	Para No.	Subject
14.		22**	Over-provisioning of corrugated card board boxes
15.		29*	Import of mountaineering equipment and sports items
16.		31*	Avoidable payment of detention charges
17.	No. 7 of 1997	18*	Management of Defence Land
18.		23**	Avoidable expenditure on Demurrage charges
19.		27**	Non-realisation of claims from the Railways.
20.		69**	Defective construction of blast pens and taxi track
21.	No. 7 of 1998	30**	Avoidable payment of container detention charges
22.		32*	Infructuous expenditure on procurement of substandard cylinders
23.		36**	Procurement of batteries at higher rates
24.	No. 7 of 2000	52***	Repowering of Vijayanta Tank
25.	No. 7 of 2001	15**	Procurement of an incomplete equipment
26.		19**	Infructuous expenditure on procurement of entertainment films
27.		32*	Wrongful credit of sale proceeds of usufructs to regimental fund
28.	No.7A of 2001	@Entire Report (ATN for 8 out of 42 paras yet to be received even for the 1 st time)	Review of Procurement for OP VIJAY(Army)
(ii) Pending more than 5 years upto 10 years			
29.	No. 6 of 2003	2*	Exploitation of Defence lands
30.		11**	Recoveries effected at the instance of Audit

Sl.No.	Report No. and Year	Para No.	Subject
31.		14*	Irregular recruitment of personnel
32.	No. 6 of 2004	3.2*	Recoveries/Savings at the instance of Audit.
33.	No. 6 of 2005	3.2*	Recoveries/savings at the instance of Audit
34.	No.18 of 2005 (Performance Audit)	Standalone Report**	Performance Audit of the Directorate General of Quality Assurance
35.	Report No. 4 of 2007	3.3**	Unauthorised use of Defence assets and public fund for running educational institutes
36.		3.5*	Recoveries/savings at the instance of Audit
37.		6.2**	Irregular payment of counter insurgency allowance
(iii)	Pending more than 3 years upto 5 years		
38.	Report No. CA 4 of 2008	3.2**	Avoidable extra expenditure in procurement of blankets
39.		3.3**	Recovery and savings at the instance of Audit
40.		3.4**	Avoidable loss due to acceptance of defective ammunition
41.	Report No. PA 4 of 2008 (Performance Audit)	Chapter I*	Supply Chain Management of General Stores and Clothing in the Army
42.	Report No. CA 17 of 2008-09	2.7*	Non-renewal of lease of land occupied by Army Golf Club
43.		3.4*	Unauthorized use of A-1 Defence land by Army Welfare Education Society
44.		3.5***	Utilisation of Government assets for non-governmental purposes
45.		3.10***	Recoveries and savings at the instance of Audit
46.		4.1*	Irregular diversion of savings of a project for execution of new works
(iv)	Pending upto 3 years		

Sl.No.	Report No. and Year	Para No.	Subject
47.	Report No. 12 of 2010-11	2.1**	Defective import of SMERCH Multi Barrel Rocket Launcher System
48.		3.2*	Irregular procurement of Punched Tape Concertina Coil
49.		3.6***	Recoveries and savings at the instance of Audit
50.		4.1*	Irregular sanction and construction of accommodation for a Golf Club
51.		4.3*	Additional expenditure on execution of a work due to indecision by the users
52.		5.2**	Misappropriation of Government stores
53.	Report No. 6 of 2010-11 (Performance Audit)	Standalone Report***	Supply Chain Management of Rations in Indian Army
54.	Report No. 14 of 2010-11 (Performance Audit)	Standalone Report***	Canteen Stores Department
55.	Report No. 35 of 2010-11 (Performance Audit)	Standalone Report*	Defence Estates Management
56.	Report No. 11 of 2011-12 (Performance Audit)	Entire Report*	Special report on Adarsh Co-operative Housing Society, Mumbai
57.	Report No. 24 of 2011-12	2.5*	Deficient pre-despatch inspection
58.		3.1*	Extra expenditure due to acceptance of higher rates
59.		3.3**	Irregular payment of field area allowance
60.		3.4**	Irregular de-hiring of house constructed on leased land
61.		3.5*	Deficiency of fire fighting staff at Central Ammunition Depot
62.		3.6**	Loss of ₹ 1.19 crore due to irregularities in the account of Hay

Sl.No.	Report No. and Year	Para No.	Subject
63.		3.8***	Avoidable expenditure due to rejection of a valid tender
64.		3.9*	Loss due to non-inclusion of laid down clause-in wheat grinding contracts
65.		3.10**	Injudicious procurement of Tippers
66.		3.11**	Irregular payment to Civil Hired Transport Contractors
67.		3.13*	Procurement of defective spares from foreign vendor
68.		3.14***	Recoveries and savings at the instance of Audit
69.		4.1**	Overpayment in Electricity Bills
70.		5.1**	Loss due to collapse of a bridge
71.		5.2**	Non-completion of bridge after twelve years of sanction
72.	Report No.16 of 2012-13	2.1*	Loss of revenue on renewal of lease of Government land
73.		2.2*	Illegal sale of Defence land
74.		2.3*	Loss due to non-levy of licence fee on vehicles entering Cantonment Board Ahmednagar
75.		2.5***	Loss of indigenously designed/manufactured ammunition
76.		3.1***	Unauthorised use of defence assets and manpower for the benefit of Army Welfare Education Society
77.		3.2*	Unfruitful expenditure on development of Modular Charge System for field guns
78.		3.3**	Failure of HQ Southern Command to Safeguard Defence land from commercial exploitation
79.		3.4*	Overpayment of conservancy charges to Cantonment Board Pune
80.		3.5**	Projection of inflated requirement of ammunition
81.		3.6***	Extra expenditure due to non-acceptance of reasonable L1 rates

Sl.No.	Report No. and Year	Para No.	Subject
82.		3.7***	Recoveries, savings and adjustment in accounts at the instance of Audit
83.		4.1*	Overpayment of water charges by Garrison Engineer Kamptee
84.		4.2**	Excess payment of water charges by Garrison Engineer Hisar
85.		4.3**	Construction of sub standard bunkers
86.		4.4*	Extra payment to a contractor
87.		5.2***	Undue benefit to a supplier
88.		7**	Project management in R&D Establishment
89.	Report No. 18 of 2012-13	Entire Report*	Performance Audit of the Medical Establishments in Defence Services

* Action Taken Notes examined by Audit but yet to be finalised by the Ministry in the light of Audit remarks – 37

** ATNs vetted by Audit but copy of the finalised ATNs awaited from Ministry – 38

*** Action Taken Notes not received even for the first time - 13

@ Part ATN received – 01

ANNEXURE-II*(Referred to in paragraph 6.1.4.1)***Details of Spillover Issues in Ordnance Factories for the year 2011-12****(₹ in crore)**

Sl No	Name of the Factory	Cost of Production ¹	Spill over Issues					Total
			Army	Navy	Air-Force	MHA incl State Police	R&D/ other Def Dept	
1	Vehicles Factory Jabalpur	1433.67	854.92	Nil	Nil	0.99	Nil	855.91 ²
2	Ordnance Factory Badmal	605.74	281.68	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	281.68 ³
3	Ordnance Factory Khamaria	1183.09	278.16	1.24	29.79	Nil	Nil	309.19 ⁴
4	Gun Carriage Factory Jabalpur	525.94	87.74	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	87.74 ⁵
5	Gun Shell Factory Cossipore	342.78	16.10	Nil	Nil	Nil	0.86	16.96 ⁶
6	Ordnance Clothing Factory Shahjahanpur	297.06	29.64	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	29.64 ⁷
	Grand Total	4388.28	1548.24	1.24	29.79	0.99	0.86	1581.12

¹ Data of Cost of Production taken from Annual Accounts of Ordnance & Ordnance Equipment Factories in India Vol-II for the year 2011-12

² Production Status Report of Vehicle Factory Jabalpur for the year 2011-12

³ OFBL letter No. 7501/AQ/CA/LTA Party-II dated 16 March 2013

⁴ Data extracted from the records of P Issue Voucher Register during Feb/March 2012 and Nominal Issue Voucher Register of OF Khamaria

⁵ Data extracted from PPC package of GCF Jabalpur

⁶ Data extracted from the records of P Issue Voucher issued on Feb/March 2012 and connected Inspection Note of GSF Cossipore

⁷ Data extracted from the records of P Issue Voucher issued on 31.03.12 and connected non-returnable material gate pass register OCF Shahjahanpur.

ANNEXURE-III

(Referred to in paragraph 6.1.6)

Details of Direct/Indirect labour charges and supervision charges

(`in crore)

Division	Year	Direct Labour	Indirect Labour	Percentage of Indirect Labour to Direct Labour	Total Labour Charges	Super vision charges	Percentage of Supervision charges to Total Labour Charges	Percentage of Supervision charges to Direct Labour Charges
Material & Components	2007-08	116	125	108	241	143	59	123
	2008-09	137	190	139	327	205	63	150
	2009-10	198	193	97	391	267	68	135
	2010-11	221	159	72	380	249	66	113
	2011-12 ⁸	250	212	85	462	321	70	128
Weapons, Vehicles and Equipment	2007-08	188	185	98	373	236	63	126
	2008-09	224	292	130	516	342	66	153
	2009-10	298	312	105	610	433	71	145
	2010-11	355	250	70	605	419	69	118
	2011-12	417	348	83	765	495	65	119
Ammunition and Explosive	2007-08	168	156	93	324	246	76	146
	2008-09	205	250	122	455	380	84	185
	2009-10	299	243	81	542	477	88	160
	2010-11	349	194	56	543	489	90	140
	2011-12	396	318	80	714	560	79	141
Armoured Vehicles	2007-08	73	63	86	136	98	72	134
	2008-09	97	101	104	198	172	87	177
	2009-10	137	100	73	237	229	97	167
	2010-11	162	100	62	262	210	80	130
	2011-12	191	146	76	337	267	79	140
Ordnance Equipment	2007-08	111	54	49	165	53	32	48
	2008-09	136	93	68	229	99	43	73
	2009-10	186	117	63	303	102	34	55
	2010-11	233	66	28	299	114	38	49
	2011-12	266	125	47	391	156	40	59
Total	2007-08	655	583	89	1238	776	63	118
	2008-09	800	926	116	1726	1199	69	150
	2009-10	1118	965	86	2083	1508	72	135
	2010-11	1320	769	58	2086	1480	71	112
	2011-12	1520	1149	76	2669	1799	67	118

⁸ Annual Production Accounts of the Ordnance & Ordnance Equipment Factories for the year 2011-12

ANNEXURE-IV*(Referred to in paragraph 6.1.12)***Statement showing factory-wise abnormal stock holding***(₹ in crore)*

Sl No	Name of Factory	Consumption of direct and indirect Stores in 2011-12	Consumption on per day	Stores in hand as of 31 March 2012	Holding in number of days consumption	Authorised holding in terms of days	Excess holding in terms of days
1	Ordnance Factory Kanpur	215.80	0.599	199.68	333.10	120	213
2	Ordnance Factory Ambajhari	349.09	0.969	242.49	250.06	120	130
3	Ordnance Factory Trichy	68.87	0.191	43.18	225.71	120	106
4	Ordnance Factory Khamaria	899	2.497	550.73	220.53	120	101
5	Opto Electronic Factory Dehradun	365.12	1.014	266.11	262.37	180	82
6	Gun and Shell Factory Cossipore	230.58	0.640	128.37	200.42	120	80
7	Ordnance Factory Chanda	1156.93	3.213	642.47	199.91	120	80
8	Machine Tool Prototype Factory Ambarnath	47.13	0.130	25.20	192.48	120	72
9	Ordnance Factory Medak	410.59	1.140	286.80	251.46	180	71
10	Ordnance Factory Bolangir	509.89	1.416	270.78	191.18	120	71
11	Ordnance Factory Varangaon	250.66	0.696	130.73	187.75	120	68
12	Cordite Factory Aruvankadu	44.61	0.123	23.10	186.41	120	66

(Details of excess stock holding at Ordnance Factories prepared by Audit from Annual Production Accounts and Annual Store Accounts of Ordnance Factories for the year 2011-12)