

Press Brief of Standalone Report of Performance Audit on “*Outcomes of Higher Education in Rajasthan*”

In accordance with Article 151 of the Constitution of India, Comptroller and Auditor General of India (CAG) submits his Audit Reports to the Governor of State for laying on the table of the Legislature. Accordingly, Report of Performance Audit on “*Outcomes of Higher Education in Rajasthan*” - Government of Rajasthan, has been laid on the table of the State Legislature on 14.09.2021. As per procedure, the Report of the CAG stand referred to the Public Accounts Committee of the State Legislature.

Purpose for undertaking this performance audit

According to the Twelfth Five Year Plan (FYP) document, higher education in India suffers from two basic concerns: the low Gross Enrolment Ratio (GER) and the quality of higher education marked by lack of world class higher educational institutions (HEIs) in the country. According to All India Survey on Higher Education (AISHE) Reports the ranking of Rajasthan for GER among all States/Union Territories (UTs) in higher education declined from 20 (2010-11) to 23 (2018-19). Since Rajasthan fared poorly in terms of both gross enrolment and quality of education being provided by the HEIs, it was decided to conduct a Performance Audit of the ‘*Outcomes of Higher Education in Rajasthan*’.

Identification of outcomes and their measurement in higher education was a challenging task. Based on extensive interactions with domain experts, and on various policy documents, audit assessed and evaluated the State’s performance in achieving outcomes of higher education with reference to ‘*whether the Higher Education system led to increased employability and progress to higher studies for students of HEIs*’; ‘*whether the Higher Education system contributed to society through effective teaching learning processes and high quality research*’; ‘*whether equitable Access to Quality Higher Education was ensured for all, and whether Governance and Management of Higher Education system was adequate and effective*’ in selected three state universities (University of Rajasthan (UoR), Jaipur; Jai Narain Vyas University (JNVU), Jodhpur and Govind Guru Tribal University (GGTU), Banswara) and their 69 constituent colleges/affiliated government and private colleges providing education in general streams (Science/Arts/ Commerce) for the period 2014-19.

The significant audit findings noticed during this performance audit were:

Chapter II: Student Progression towards Employment and Higher Studies

- Career counselling cell/placement cells and alumni associations were either dysfunctional or non-existent. Employability enhancement programmes were not organized in 99 *per cent* of the test checked HEIs. None of the students undertook field projects/internships during 2018-19 in the test-checked HEIs.

(Paragraphs 2.1.1.1 and 2.1.2.2)

- Very few new courses focusing on employability/entrepreneurship/skill development were introduced in UoR, Jaipur and JNVU, Jodhpur during 2014-19.

(Paragraphs 2.1.2.3 and 2.1.2.4)

- Data related to student employment and progression to higher studies was not maintained either by Commissionerate, College Education for State level or by test checked universities as well as their affiliated colleges.

(Paragraphs 2.1.3.1 to 2.1.3.2)

Chapter III: Quality of Higher Education

- Feedback from stakeholders such as industrialists, entrepreneurs, students were not obtained in UoR, Jaipur and JNVU, Jodhpur during designing/ revision of curriculum of general degree programmes.

(Paragraph 3.1.1.2)

- Curriculum/syllabus of 96 *per cent* programmes in UoR, Jaipur and 64 *per cent* programmes in JNVU, Jodhpur were revised during 2014-19 (in 11 selected departments), while GGTU, Banswara did not revise curriculum of any programme since its establishment in 2012 up to 2019.

(Paragraph 3.1.1.3)

- During 2018-19, only 10.75 *per cent* classrooms were ICT enabled and 30.59 *per cent* teachers were using ICT tools in teaching in the three test checked universities.

(Paragraph 3.1.2.2)

- Availability of faculty was insufficient in government colleges which resulted in Student Teacher Ratio being as high as 88:1 (average), more than four times the prescribed limit of 20:1. Efforts towards professional development of teachers were also insufficient.

(Paragraph 3.1.2.3 (A) and 3.1.2.4)

- UoR, Jaipur could utilize only 45.82 *per cent* of approved grants on research projects and complete only 39 *per cent* of the research projects. Further, no patent could be awarded as an outcome of the completed research projects. In JNVU, Jodhpur, none of the 14 research projects could be completed even after utilising 62.60 *per cent* of research grants. No research project was undertaken in GGTU, Banswara. Alarming, in UoR, Jaipur, 72 thesis submitted by PhD students were pending for evaluation/ examination with the examiners since 2007 upto 2019.

(Paragraph 3.2.1)

Chapter IV: Access and Equity in Higher Education

- GoR did not have a specific policy for establishment of new colleges in unserved areas and did not undertake geographical mapping to identify habitations that lacked higher education facilities.

(Paragraph 4.1.1.1 and 4.1.1.2)

- There were urban/rural and region wise imbalances in availability of HEIs. Availability of seats in Science and Commerce streams decreased while availability of Arts stream increased during 2014-15 to 2018-19.

(Paragraph 4.1.2.1 to 4.1.2.3)

- Though GER of Rajasthan increased from 18.2 *per cent* in 2010-11 to 23 *per cent* in 2018-19 but it has consistently been lower than national figure.

(Paragraph 4.2)

- Adequate basic infrastructure like academic and administrative building, laboratory, library and furniture was not available in GGTU, Banswara and majority of the test checked government and private colleges.

(Paragraph 4.4.1)

Chapter V: Governance and Management

- State Level Quality Assurance Cell (SLQAC) neither maintained the data regarding number of colleges which had constituted Internal Quality Assurance Cell nor developed a mechanism to monitor it. Prescribed meetings of Governing Bodies such as Senate, Syndicate/Board of Management and Academic Council were not held during 2014-19 in all the three test checked Universities.

(Paragraph 5.1.1.2 and 5.1.2.1)

- The position of National Assessment and Accreditation Council (NAAC) accredited HEIs in the state was dismal as only 6.04 *per cent* of eligible HEIs were NAAC accredited as of January 2020. Further the fact that only 0.66 *per cent* of accredited HEIs obtained A⁺/A grade indicated poor quality of higher education being imparted in HEIs in the state.

(Paragraph 5.4)

- GoR released the state share amounting to ₹ 150.95 crore with a delay ranging from 18 to 428 days beyond the prescribed 15 days of the receipts of the central share during 2014-19.

(Paragraph 5.6.2.2)