



SUPREME AUDIT INSTITUTION OF INDIA
लोकहितार्थ सत्यनिष्ठा
Dedicated to Truth in Public Interest

PRESS BRIEF

Report of the

Comptroller and Auditor General of India

on

Construction and Operation of Lucknow Metro Rail Project



Government of Uttar Pradesh

Report No. 12 of 2025

(Performance Audit – Commercial)

Press Brief

Audit Report No. 12 of 2025 of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India on Performance Audit on Construction and Operation of Lucknow Metro Rail Project

Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India on Performance Audit on Construction and Operation of Lucknow Metro Rail Project (Report No. 12 of 2025 – Government of Uttar Pradesh) has been laid before the State Legislature on

Government of Uttar Pradesh (GoUP) in the Budget for 2013-14 included an announcement for metro rail project in Lucknow. Delhi Metro Rail Corporation Ltd. (DMRCL) prepared Detailed Project Report (DPR) with two corridors i.e., North-South corridor covering 22.88 km and East-West corridor covering 11.10 km. The DPR was finally approved in October 2013 and in-principle approval of North-South corridor i.e., Phase-1A of the project was granted by Government of India (GoI) in December 2013.

Lucknow Metro Rail Corporation Limited (the Company) was incorporated in November 2013 to execute Lucknow Metro Rail Project. The work on North-South corridor of Lucknow Metro was commenced in September 2014 and completed in March 2019 with 22.88 km of length. Name of the Company was later changed to Uttar Pradesh Metro Rail Corporation Limited (UPMRCL) on 23 October 2019. This Company is a joint venture of GoI and GoUP with 50:50 equity contribution.

Performance Audit on Construction and Operation of Phase-1A of Lucknow Metro Rail Project was taken up with the objective to examine whether (i) effective planning was done to ensure economic viability and selection of the most appropriate technologies; (ii) implementation in terms of project execution and contract management was done with due care, economy, and in a timely and transparent manner; (iii) an adequate mechanism was in existence to monitor the project to ensure timely completion and conformity of works executed with laid down specifications; and (iv) the operation and maintenance were efficient, and the planned benefits were achieved after commercial operation.

The Performance Audit covered the activities of Phase-1A of the project for the period since its inception in November 2013 to March 2023. A total of 51 (21 major works and 30 minor works) contracts involving ₹ 4,987.21 crore out of total 144 contracts relating to civil, rolling stock, track, electrical, signalling & telecom, property development and operation & maintenance were covered in audit. The Indian Institute of Technology, Kanpur (IIT Kanpur) was engaged for providing technical consultancy during review of the technical aspects of the Phase-1A project.

(A) Planning

The GoI accorded in-principle approval (December 2013) for taking up the Phase-1A of Lucknow Metro Rail Project covering a total length of 22.88 km with 22 stations. Audit noticed that the Company constructed only 21 metro stations in North-South corridor and excluded Mahanagar Metro station, which had second highest projected daily loading capacity in 2021 as per the DPR, from the project without approval from the concerned authority.

(Paragraph No. 2.3)

The Company did not comply with conditions contained in the in-principle approval of the GoI to the project such as periodic fare revision, setting up of District Urban Transport Fund and framing of advertising and parking policy.

(Paragraph No. 2.4)

For bulk extraction of ground water, any commercial organisation was mandatorily required to apply and obtain permission from Central Ground Water Authority (CGWA)/Ground Water

**Audit Report No. 12 of 2025 of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India on Performance Audit
on Construction and Operation of Lucknow Metro Rail Project**

Department, GoUP (GWD). Audit found that Company did not get registered in CGWA/GWD, UP for obtaining NOC during 2013-23.

(Paragraph No. 2.5)

(B) Contract and Project Management

The company did not open the financial bid of M/s Gammon India Limited despite its name being recommended by the technical evaluation committee. In reply, the State Government stated that it was a conscious decision of the Board based on past performance of M/s Gammon India Limited at Delhi and Chennai metro project and lack of desirable safety measure and avoidable delay in these projects. The reply was not acceptable because if the Company had prior information about the unsatisfactory past performance of M/s Gammon India Limited, it should not have allowed M/s Gammon India Limited to participate in the technical bidding stage itself.

(Paragraph No. 3.1)

A lump sum work of Schedule E (miscellaneous work under DSR-2014) of LKCC-07 was executed to ₹ 51.40 crore against the bonded cost of ₹ 15.75 crore. The Company provided the details of items of works of only ₹ 1.30 crore despite repeated requests made for providing by Audit. The State Government did not respond on this issue.

(Paragraph No. 3.6.1)

The Company awarded (June 2017) a contract for advertisement rights in trains of Metro Phase-1A (N-S Corridor). Despite taking over 12 train sets, the licensee had not paid license fee to the Company. Moreover, the Company relieved the licensee from the license fee payment instead of acting as per provisions of the licensee agreement for recovery of license fee including Goods and Services Tax (GST). In reply, the State Government stated that license fee was not collected as the advertising agency had not utilised these train sets. The reply was not acceptable since the licensee was bound to pay license fee for these 12 train sets as per the license agreement.

(Paragraph No. 3.5)

The Project authorities of the Company neither collected Form MM-11 (transit pass) before making payment to the contractor nor ensured the deductions of royalty and price of minerals amounting to ₹ 3.16 crore from the contractor.

(Paragraph No. 3.8.1)

The Company procured 25.80 hectares of land for construction of depot of Lucknow Metro. However, 1.98 hectares (7.67 per cent) out of this land was disputed and already under litigation. The Company constructed depot on the acquired land including the disputed land. Audit noticed that the tripartite agreement among the Company, Additional District Magistrate (Land Acquisition), and parties related to disputed land lacked signatures of some of the related parties. This agreement was not registered also. As such, the agreement was not legally enforceable and may attract litigation in case of disagreement among the parties. In reply, the State Government stated that the tripartite agreement on stamp paper was not required as the ownership of disputed land was not clear. Needless expenditure on stamp duties and registration fee would have to be borne by the Company. The reply was not acceptable because construction of the depot on the disputed land was against the financial rules. Also, non-registered tripartite agreement was not legally enforceable.

(Paragraph No. 3.9)

(C) Operation & Maintenance

The tests conducted by IIT (Kanpur) on the rail samples provided by the Company to determine the hardness value of rails at depot area and mainline, revealed that the hardness value was less as compared to the Indian Railway Standard (IRS) specification issued in December 2009. In reply, the State Government stated that the tests have not been conducted by IIT in accordance with prescribed codal provisions. The earlier tests carried out during procurement demonstrated that the hardness measured satisfied the provisions enumerated in "IRS-T-12-2009". In response, IIT Kanpur stated that testing procedures applied by it were as per the standards (IS 1500:2005).

(Paragraph No. 4.2.2)

A certified cyber security agency for routine Vulnerability Assessment and Penetration Testing (VAPT) was not empanelled to examine the security and therefore, the metro system was susceptible to threat and malfunction.

(Paragraph No. 4.2.1)

The Interim Speed Certificate (ISC) was not renewed despite its requirement after expiry of five years from the date of its issue (March 2017). In absence of ISC, wear and tear in wheel of rolling stock and adjustment needed thereof could not be ascertained. By not renewing the Speed Certificate after expiry of five years, the Company has taken unnecessary risk with the safety of passengers. In reply, the State Government stated that as per Procedure for Safety Certification and Technical Clearance of Metro System (PSTM)-2015, ISC shall remain valid till the issuance of the final speed certificate as no extension provision of ISC (such as 5 years) is defined. The reply was not factual because the PSTM-2015 does not state that ISC shall remain valid till the issuance of the Final Speed Certificate. Therefore, ISC issued to Lucknow metro was valid only for five years as specifically mentioned in ISC and was required to be renewed thereafter.

(Paragraph No. 4.3)

(D) Revenue Management

Operating revenue of the Company increased from ₹ 5.55 crore to ₹ 99.35 crore (1690.10 *per cent*) during the period 2017-18 to 2023-24 with average growth of 281.62 *per cent*. During this duration, operating expenses also increased from ₹ 16.17 crore to ₹ 76.11 crore. Nevertheless, it was encouraging for the Company that it earned operating revenue more than the operating expenses after five years of operations of Lucknow Metro Rail Project.

(Paragraph No. 5.1)

The company could not achieve the year-wise footfall and revenue from operations anywhere near the projections envisaged in the DPR. In reply, the State Government stated that year-wise footfall and revenue operations projected in the DPR was made considering combined traffic from both North-south and East-West corridors, however, East-West corridor could not be made operational.

(Paragraph No. 5.1)

The revenue of Lucknow Metro mainly consists of fare box collection and non-fare box collection (property development, advertisement, parking, etc.). Audit noticed that company could not explore the possibility of leasing out 54,196 sq. ft. available commercial spaces as of March 2025. Besides, bids for 15,984.54 sq. ft. available parking spaces were also not invited by the Company during 2017-24.

(Paragraph No. 5.3.1)

**Audit Report No. 12 of 2025 of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India on Performance Audit
on Construction and Operation of Lucknow Metro Rail Project**

The GoUP identified (October 2013) land to be provided to the Company for property development but the same was handed over to the Company in April 2022 after lapse of more than eight years. Moreover, the Company did not utilise 86.10 acres of land for property development after lapse of almost three years since receipt of the same.

(Paragraph No. 5.3.2)

Audit recommends that the Company should:

- *ensure that any change if required in metro station conceived under the Project is carried out only after the approval of the authority who had sanctioned the original Project.*
- *ensure that terms of contract are adhered to and a system should be in place to recover dues and irregular/excess payment of advance.*
- *fix responsibility where variation & extra items are beyond limits in a contract without sanction from proper delegated authority, thus vitiating the contract integrity.*
- *obtain Form MM-11 (transit pass) from the contractors to ensure that the minerals used in the construction works of the metro have been procured from legal sources and royalties etc. are deposited in Government Account.*
- *ensure full compliance with the statutory provisions, rules, Central Vigilance Commission guidelines, Indian Railway Standards/ specifications, agreements, etc.*
- *ensure to empanel a certified cyber security agency for routine vulnerability assessment and penetration testing to avoid susceptible threat and malfunctioning of the communication-based train control system.*
- *devise ways to attract commuters into the metro by providing end to end connectivity to increase the ridership and revenue.*
- *ensure timely development of land available for property development and also ensure realisation of optimal revenue from developed properties through timely leasing out of available commercial and parking spaces.*



(Raj Kumar)
Principal Accountant General

For any further information on these subjects, please contact us at following address:

Spokesperson : Sr. Dy. Accountant General
O/o the Principal Accountant General (Audit-I),
Uttar Pradesh, Prayagraj-211001

Email : dagadm.n.up2.au@cag.gov.in **Website** : <https://cag.gov.in/ag1/uttar-pradesh/en>

Phone : 0532-2624757 **Fax No.** : 05322424102